

Final Project Review Report

March 2011

United Nations Development Programme The United Republic of Tanzania 2010 Elections Support Project

> Award ID: 57788 Project Duration: June 2009 – June 2011 Extension(s): July 2011 – October 2011 Total Budget: USD 28,647,110 Donor Contributions: USD 28,018,323 UNDP TRAC Fund: USD 1,000,000 CO Focal Points: Philippe Poinsot, Louise Chamberlain, Nora Pendaeli Report Prepared By: Thomas Crick Date of Report: 20th March 2011

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

UNDAF Outcome(s):	Strengthened democratic structures and systems of good governance and the application of human rights
Expected Country Programme Outcome:	Strengthened political, parliamentary and electoral systems that enhance effective participation and representation, bearing in mind gender consideration, and greater political tolerance, oversight and credible elections
Project Goal:	The overarching goal of the project is to support the United Republic of Tanzania and the Government of Zanzibar to prepare for and conduct free, fair, and credible elections in 2010, whose results represent the will of the Tanzanian electorate at large and meet international standards.

The Election Support Project 2010 is supported by Canada, Denmark, the European Union, Finland, the Netherlands, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland, UNDP and the United Kingdom, and is managed under the auspices of the United Nations Development Programme in Tanzania.

Table of Contents

EXE	CU	TIVE S	SUMMARY	4
I.		NTEX		
II.	PR		T RESULTS SUMMARY	
	1.		ort to Electoral Management Bodies (EMBs)	
	2.		ort for voter education	
	3.	Supp	ort to political parties	14
		Supp	ort to women as voters and as candidates	16
	4.	Supp	ort for media	17
	5.	Supp	ort for key civil society networks and specialized organizations	19
	6.	Supp	ort for elections observation missions	20
	7.	Supp	ort for promotion of a secure and peaceful electoral environment	
III.	PE		MANCE REVIEW	
	1.	PRO	GRESS REVIEW	
		(i)	Overall progress towards the CPAP outcome	
		(ii)	Capacity development	
		(iii)	Gender mainstreaming	
		(iv)	Human Rights mainstreaming	
		(v)	Communication and publicity	
	2.	ÎMPL	EMENTATION STRATEGY REVIEW	
		(i)	Sustainability	
		(ii)	Participatory/consultative processes	
		(iii)	Quality of partnerships	
		(iv)	National ownership	
	3.	MÁN	AGEMENT EFFECTIVENESS REVIEW	30
	0.	(i)	Monitoring and Evaluation	
		(ii)	Timely delivery of outputs	
		(iii)	Cost-effective use of inputs Error! Bookmark not	
IV.	IMF			
V.			S LEARNED	
VI.			AL STATUS AND UTILISATION	
		(i)	Financial Summary	
		(ii)	Financial Overview	
		(iii)	Financial Utilization	
VII.	ΔN	· · ·	S	-
•				
			zed project results by Component	
			ocument	
			affing chart	
	1 10	1001.31		

ACRONYMS

CMS CO CPAP CSO DDTP	Candidate Management System Country Office UNDP Country Programme Action Plan Civil Society Organization Deepening Democracy in Tanzania Project	NIM PMU PNVR Prodoc PNVR	National Implementation Project Management Unit Permanent National Voter Register Project Document Permanent National Voter Register
DEX DFID	Direct Execution Department for International Development	PWD RC	Persons with Disabilities Resident Coordinator
DIM	Direct Implementation	REDET	Research and Education for Democracy in Tanzania
DGU DP DPA EAD EMB ESP EU HF ICT IDS	Democracy and Governance Unit Development Partners Department for Political Affairs Electoral Affairs Division Election Management Body Election Support Project European Union High Frequency Information Communication Technology Institute for Development Studies	RMS SC TAMWA TAWLA TBC TC TCD TEC TEMCO TGNP	Results Management System Steering Committee Tanzania Media Women's Association Tanzania Women Lawyers' Association Tanzania Broadcasting Company Technical Committee Tanzania Centre for Democracy Tanzania Episcopal Conference Tanzania Election Monitoring Committee Tanzania Gender Networking Programme
IRRS JCCC	Incident Reporting & Response System Joint Command and Communication Centres	TPF UNDAF	Tanzania Police Force United Nations Development Assistance Framework
LEA LOA LTA	Law Enforcement Agency Letter of Agreement Long Term Agreement	UNDP UNEAD UNESCO	United Nations Development Programme United Nations Electoral Affairs Division United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation
M&E MCT NAM NEC NEX	Monitoring and Evaluation Media Council of Tanzania Needs Assessment Mission National Electoral Commission National Execution	VE VEGF VERG VHF ZEC	Voter Education Voter Education Grants Facility Voter Education Reference Group Very High Frequency Zanzibar Electoral Commission

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The 2010 Election Support Project aimed to strengthen national capacities for the implementation of free, fair and credible elections, with a focus on strengthening the national leadership of Electoral Management Bodies (EMBs) and engagement of political parties, media and other civil society, as well as national security management institutions. The project was directly implemented by UNDP through a dedicated Project Management Unit, and financial support was provided through a basket fund of contributions from nine Development Partners and UNDP.

The main achievements over the duration of the project (from July 2009 to October 2011) were:

Support for Zanzibar Referendum: UNDP assisted ZEC to hold a referendum on a Government of National Unity in July 2010. A range of support was provided including election materials and IT equipment, operational planning, training of poll workers and establishing a results centre. The referendum was highly successful and set the foundation for a peaceful general election in Zanzibar the following October.

Procurement of Election Day equipment: elections materials with a total value of USD2.5m were procured and delivered well in advance of the elections. These included 45,000 ballot boxes, 132,000 bottles of ink, 1.8m seals and 2,800 voting booths. UNDP also procured a large range of IT equipment for processing of candidate nominations and results.

ICT support for the EMBs: the project developed Candidate and Results Management Systems, providing substantial improvements in functionality, security and auditing over the systems in place in 2005. This enhanced the transparency and credibility of the results aggregation process.

Assets management: bespoke software and on the job training was provided to the EMBs and TPF to enable them to register and manage all of their assets effectively, including those provided by the project. This has given them unprecedented ability to manage custody, handovers and deployment of equipment to and from the field.

Election complaints and appeals process: 190 magistrates and 84 judges were provided with training on the electoral complaints and appeals process. Judges from Uganda and Kenya shared their experiences in effective complaints handling. This was the first training of its kind in Tanzania.

Multi-layered voter education campaign: all available media were used to deliver voter education, including: distribution of 1.2 million booklets targeting disadvantaged groups; 3 million posters; TV and radio spots and programmes broadcast both nationally and on local networks, special activities and materials targeting PWDs, women, non-literates and youth; a CSO grants facility aimed at community level mobilisation, etc. The campaign was advised by Voter Education Reference Groups on the mainland and Zanzibar, each with representation of a range of election stakeholders.

Training and support to political parties: over 5,100 party agents and officials were trained on the electoral legal framework, working with the media, the specific needs of women and disadvantaged groups. UNDP provided parties with resource kits including 1,000 copies of various legal texts and 40,000 flyers on the role, rights and obligations of party agents. The project also facilitated the process of amending the Code of Ethics, which was endorsed by all political parties.

Support for women as voters and as candidates: UNDP collaborated with UN agencies and national women's organizations to: train 800 women candidates for the parliamentary and council seats; sensitize journalists, political parties, community & religious leaders and the EMBs on the special needs of women in elections; produce specific VE materials for women; women's radio listening groups in remote areas; and a research study on women's political participation in 2010.

Support for the media: the project supported updating and strengthening of the two Media Codes of Conduct, trained 700 journalists on unbiased election reporting, and commissioned monitoring and analysis of media coverage of the elections. A newsletter summarizing election-related press coverage was circulated daily to journalists in 60 radio and TV stations in remote areas.

National election observation: 7,350 short-term observers and 223 long-term observers were trained and deployed to observe political campaigns, polling, counting and results aggregation. This was a five-fold increase over the 2005 elections, when only 1,500 observers were deployed. UNDP established two Observer Support Centres for accreditation and logistical/information support.

Training of Police: more than 4,451 officers (794 of them women) were trained on human rights and the role of the police in the elections. 157 police commanders and police trainers received Public Order training on modern policing techniques, community mediation, and non-lethal tactics for dealing with riots and unrest. The Police were praised for their conduct during the elections.

Incident Reporting and Response System: TPF's radio communications capacity was significantly upgraded country-wide, with coordination centres established in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar and custom software provided to enable tracking and analysis of reported incidents. Data from 10 regions show a 27% increase in reporting of incidents of all types after deployment of the system.

Confidence building and dialogue: In Zanzibar, where elections have long been marred by violence, a dialogue for peace process with broad participation of election stakeholders provided opportunities for improved understanding and a foundation for peaceful resolution of differences.

The finding of the independent evaluation of ESP was that the project has had "a **significant impact** on its democratic governance objectives", and that the project successfully supported the EMBs to conduct the electoral process in a credible manner under peaceful conditions. Approximately 77% of project results were fully achieved, 22% partially achieved, and 1% not achieved.

Main contributing factors to the project's progress were: the project design drew directly on the lessons learned from previous UNDP election support in Tanzania, and reflected the inputs obtained from consultations with stakeholders; a strong focus was placed on mainstreaming gender and human rights in project activities; the project worked through a broad range of partnerships, with DPs, CSOs and civil society networks, the media, political parties, LEAs, observer groups, etc.; project governance arrangements provided effective oversight and constructive support without overburdening the project; significant services and materials were efficiently procured by UNDP on time and to specifications, and value for money was ensured in the process;

maintaining a separate sub-office in Zanzibar enabled effective support to be provided to ZEC; and, major investments in technology upgrades were carefully considered through value for money assessments or feasibility studies.

The principal challenge the project faced was the compressed implementation period due to the delayed start. Implementation of activities actually commenced in mid-March, only 7¹/₂ months before the elections. In this regard, the impact of several activities would have been greater had the lead-in time been longer, and the duration of activities had been extended to ensure longer-term benefits. A second challenge was that the EMBs lacked adequate staff to fully engage with the project at the same time as managing the elections process.

Among the main lessons learned were: a project of this size and complexity should be launched about 24 months prior to the elections, which would provide enough lead-in time for activities and procurement, setting up the PMU and its business processes, collection of baseline data and establishment of M&E practices. For sustainable outcomes, certain activities should be continued between elections, particularly: voter and civic education, dialogue between election stakeholders, upgrading of EMBs' ICT systems, and capacity development of middle and senior EMB staff, political parties and media organisations/professionals.

How this report is structured: After a brief description of the project context, this report will summarize progress against the project's stated outputs in a Project Results Summary. In this section, the main activities implemented under each project component are listed and their contribution to the attainment of each output reviewed. Result status graphs show the rate of achievement against the approved results set for each project component. Conclusions are drawn end of each sub section on overall progress, and any challenges and lessons that emerged. Sections III to V comprise a Performance Review. The Progress Review in Section III assesses the overall progress of the project towards different development outcomes and the overall capacity development process. This includes discussion of overall progress towards the CPAP outcome targeted by the project, gender and human rights mainstreaming in the project, and communication and publicity activities. The Implementation Strategy Review in Section IV assesses the quality of the project's implementation strategy, looking at the quality of the consultative process, the quality of partnerships and the extent to which the project has endeavored to ensure national ownership and sustainability. A Management Effectiveness Review in Section V reviews the effectiveness of the project management structure in terms of cost-effectiveness, timeliness, and quality of monitoring. Section VI presents a concise analysis of some of the main implementation issues that are generic to the project and not related to a specific output or activity, and adjustments performed to address these issues. Lessons learned are captured in Section VII, and Section VIII provides both a financial overview report, covering all funding provided to the project, and a financial utilization report, presenting expenditure by project component.

I. CONTEXT

The United Republic of Tanzania's fourth general election under the multiparty system was held on 31st October 2010. In response to a request from the Government of Tanzania, the National Electoral Commission (NEC) and the Zanzibar Electoral Commission (ZEC) for support for the country's 2010 elections, the United Nations Department of Political Affairs deployed a Needs Assessment Mission in August 2008 to assess the feasibility of developing an election support project. The project document was developed and subsequently signed on 15th June 2009. The project's overall aim was to support the United Republic of Tanzania and the Government of Zanzibar to prepare for and conduct free, fair and credible elections in 2010, whose results represent the will of the Tanzanian electorate at large and meet international standards. The project until 31st October 2011.

To facilitate the funding of the project, a basket fund of ten Development Partners namely, DFID, the Netherlands, EU, Canada, Finland, Norway, Switzerland, Sweden, Denmark and UNDP was established. The approved budget amounted to US\$28,647,110. With the necessity to commence planning for the update of the Permanent National Voter Register (PNVR) by NEC and the Permanent Voter Register (PVR) in ZEC, a total of US\$7,959,781 was fast-tracked using the Deepening Democracy in Tanzania Project (DDTP).

The ESP project is intended to support the realization of the overall UNDAF outcome of "Strengthened democratic structures and systems of good governance and the application of human rights". Project resources have been applied towards the achievement of CPAP outcome "Strengthened political, parliamentary and electoral systems that enhance effective participation and representation, bearing in mind gender considerations, and greater political tolerance, oversight and credible elections". This is demonstrated by progress towards the following intended project outputs:

- 1. Electoral Management Bodies (EMBs) able to plan and manage the electoral process effectively.
- 2. Voter education initiatives mobilized to ensure that voters, particularly women and marginalized groups, are educated on the registration and voting process in time to vote.
- 3. Political parties able to contribute to ensuring the transparency of voter registration, monitoring of the elections events, effective election conflict resolution, and to support female candidates.
- 4. Key print, radio and TV media publishers and journalists are able to report transparently and without bias on the electoral process.
- 5. Key civil society networks and specialized organizations supported to enhance participation and promote fairness in the electoral process.
- 6. Electoral Management Bodies supported with capacity and resources to effectively coordinate Elections Observation missions.
- 7. Electoral Management Bodies and other key stakeholders supported in the promotion of a secure and peaceful environment during the electoral process.

II. PROJECT RESULTS SUMMARY

This section reports progress against the project's stated outputs, and aims to establish whether, how, and how well the outputs were achieved. Listed under each output are the activities undertaken towards the attainment of that output. Details of progress against the targets set under each project output appear in Annex 1.

1. Electoral Management Bodies (EMBs) able to plan and manage the electoral process effectively.



Activities with partial achievement related to poor functioning of EMBs' websites and slow publishing of election results on these websites. The election hotline could not be advertised sufficiently in advance of E-Day and targets for calls from voters were not reached.

Figure 1: Results Status: Support for EMBs (% achievement of approved results for this component)

Assistance to improve the electoral legal framework:

- Following the amendments to the legal framework for elections supported by UNDP under the Deepening Democracy Project, UNDP provided technical support to amend the NEC/ZEC regulations and guidelines. This included;
 - The electoral Code of Ethics for political parties
 - The Code of Conduct for Observers
 - Provisions regulating the voting of persons with disabilities
 - Improvements for assisting pregnant women when polling

Emphasis was placed on ensuring an inclusive dialogue and broad validation of the final products.

- ii) A conference on international standards and best practice for conduct of a referendum was organised for Zanzibar stakeholders in advance of the first ever referendum. The event provided ZEC with valuable lessons from the region and advice on establishing the regulatory framework for the referendum.
- iii) Legal texts were translated from English into Kiswahili and vice versa, and some 350,000 copies of various guidelines were printed, including Manuals for Returning Officers, Guidelines for Direction Clerks, Guidelines for Political Parties and Candidates, and Guidelines for Presiding Officers.

Voter registration: On the mainland, large scale procurement of voter registration equipment (through DDTP and ESP) supported the updating of the Permanent National Voter Register (PNVR), contributing to an increase of registered voters from 15.6 million to

19.7 million. NEC was provided with advice and support for rolling out voter registration on the mainland, enabling a transition from obsolete Polaroid photos to digital camera technology. This included procurement of voter registration kits using solar technology. After the elections UNDP procured additional digital cameras, batteries and printers to replenish items in the VR kits that were lost or damaged during the earlier voter registration exercise. 100% of the components of these kits were entered into the AMS, in total some 40,000 items, providing NEC with far greater control over the equipment for future registration exercises.

In Zanzibar UNDP provided technical and material support to ZEC for establishing a fully digital biometric voter registration system, resulting in a more accurate voters' register. The project also funded running costs of voter registration and a computer expert to assess the voter registration IT system. This study was shared with Zanzibari political parties, helping to build confidence and reduce disputes over the voters' register.

Dialogue meetings with election stakeholders: To strengthen relationships between the EMBs and stakeholders and provide political parties and CSOs opportunities to input to the electoral process, meetings were facilitated between NEC/ZEC and election stakeholders, including People with Disabilities (PWDs); women, CSOs and political parties.

Procurement of Election Day equipment: UNDP procured and delivered 45,000 ballot boxes, 132,000 bottles of ink, 1.8m seals and 2,800 voting booths for the general election and the Zanzibar Referendum. No delays were experienced in the procurement or delivery process, and all materials arrived in good time, on average 6-8 weeks before the election. The total value of the international procurement was USD 2.5 million. UNDP also provided 288 laptop computers, printers, scanners, generators, servers, and digital senders for the Returning Officers, for processing of candidate nominations and election results. Procurement was carefully planned and delivered well in advance of deadlines and to specifications; value for money was also ensured through, for example, the assistance of UNDP's Procurement Services Office in Copenhagen.

Information and Communication Technology Support to the EMBs: A team of software developers was engaged to produce customized solutions for candidate and results management for the EMBs. The resultant Candidate and Results Management Systems (CMS and RMS) have been designed to allow for modification to meet the evolving needs of the EMBs for subsequent elections. As far as possible, the CMS and RMS share common software component modules, thereby improving reusability and cutting future development costs. The RMS has enabled the EMBs to publish a breakdown of all polling station results online, thus enhancing the transparency and credibility of the tabulation process. Further improvements were made to both systems after the elections, including the ability to generate and print barcodes onto ballots and results sheets, and final versions were produced in July 2011. The RMS and CMS represent a substantial advance in functionality, security and auditing over the systems in place in 2005.

The CMS enabled NEC to process more efficiently the large number of candidates, for example there were 9,000 candidates for Presidential, Parliamentary and Councilor elections, of which there was an increase in women candidates of 24% over 2005. The CMS enhanced verification of information, validation of nominators and generation of sample ballots. Data entered into the CMS formed the basis for the RMS, and the two systems were designed to dovetail. The RMS increased transparency and credibility of the results aggregation and reduced the time required for tabulation. All data communication to and from the remote results accumulation sites now occurs in a much more secure environment; separate polling station results enabled country-wide breakdown of polling station results on the internet.

In the post-election phase UNDP provided NEC with an upgraded server and operating system, virus software, and an extended programme of training for its IT staff.

Support for Zanzibar Referendum: On 31st July 2010 Tanzania held its first ever referendum, on whether to form a Government of National Unity. The referendum was also the first peaceful electoral process in the Isles since independence. UNDP provided ZEC with assistance to develop an operational plan for Referendum Day, to display the voter register and distribute voter cards, train 4,500 poll workers, and to establish the Zanzibar Referendum Results Centre. UNDP also procured the necessary seals, ink and voting booths, as well as laptops, printers and scanners, public announcement systems and generators. This equipment was used again in the General Election. The first version of the RMS was used successfully for results aggregation, enabling results to be announced within 19 hours of polling stations closing, and ZEC was also able to display a complete breakdown of polling station results on the internet the day after the elections, adding the credibility and transparency of the results aggregation process.

Information services for voters:

i) The first ever *election hotline* was set up for the EMBs enabling members of the public to call toll-free to ask questions regarding the election process. 30 operators were trained in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar to respond to Frequently Asked Questions, and answered approximately 4,000 calls during the election period. The hotline proved its usefulness to voters but its success was reduced because the project was unable to launch the service soon enough, leaving limited time for advertising its existence.

ii) *Voter Interaction System*: The project provided hardware and software for the voter interaction system to provide voters information about the location of their polling station via SMS or the internet. Unfortunately, the negotiations between NEC and the 6 main telephone companies stalled and could not be concluded in time to deploy the VIS for the elections.

Election Results Centres and Media Support Centres: UNDP established Election Results Centres and Media Centres in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar. These centres were used for communication (internet), information, and accreditation of the media. Press conferences and results announcement were also made at these venues and broadcasted country wide.

Election complaints and appeals process: In cooperation with the Chief Justice, 190 magistrates and 84 judges were provided with training regarding the electoral complaints and appeals process. This was the first training of its kind in Tanzania. The training was conducted jointly by judges from Tanzania, Uganda and Kenya and provided an opportunity for exchange of knowledge and experience of the electoral laws in the region, international standards and instruments governing democratic principles, how to deal with complaints/petitions and appeals in a timely manner, and how corruption affects the electoral process. Practical lessons were shared by Ugandan and Kenyan resource persons on how to expedite the petition process and mechanisms for alternative dispute resolution.

Assets management: UNDP provided NEC, ZEC and TPF with custom assets management software that enables accurate and real-time tracking of assets, including the ability to produce a variety of reports as well as handovers and shipping documents. UNDP assets staff provided on the job coaching on the system to assets personnel from all three institutions. Over 95% of assets procured by the project were entered by NEC, ZEC and TPF staff into their own assets databases.

Upgrading of NEC warehouse: The upgrading work fell into two categories:

- Renovation of two buildings where voter registration kits and NEC's paper materials are/will be stored.

- A security upgrade of two buildings where critical assets are stored: the Data Processing Centre and the building with the VR kits.

NEC conducted both procurement processes and managed the contracts with all suppliers. UNDPP ensured the procurement process followed by NEC respects the principles of public procurement (integrity, competition, transparency, etc.), and will verify that works are completed as per the contracts. This activity is expected to be completed by early February 2012. UNDP also provided and installed a 250KVA generator to ensure an uninterrupted power supply at the Data Processing Centre and other facilities at the NEC warehouse.

Lesson learning and analysis of the 2010 Elections: In consultation with implementing partners UNDP commissioned two key studies on different aspects of the outcomes of the 2010 elections. These were:

Study on low voter turnout in the Union election: The study was conducted by REDET and the Tanganyika Law Society. Its main objective was to identify the political, social and logistical reasons behind the apparent low voter turnout in 2010, and secondly to make a comparison with other countries in the region to assess the extent to which the trends seen in Tanzania differ from these countries.

The study comprised: a review of relevant statistical material, such as the voting figures for 2010 and earlier elections, and economic and social data for the regions and constituencies; a desk review of material published in the media on the issue; meetings with representatives of the EMBs, political parties and other stakeholders; a technical review of the PNVR, the voter registration process, the verification process and the procedures for removing deceased and lapsed voters, to estimate the incidence of duplicate, ineligible or lapsed registrations; and finally a survey conducted with a wide range of eligible voters who registered to vote in the election. This survey covered two constituencies from every region of Tanzania, with approximately 2,800 registered voters as respondents. A combination of reasons was found to have contributed to low voter turnout in 2010. Among the most pronounced were dissatisfaction with the elected leaders, the perceived failure of Government to respond to the priority needs of citizens, and inadequate civic and voter education.

Study on low voter registration turnout in Zanzibar: The study was conducted by REDET and the Zanzibar Legal Services Centre. It aimed to review the procedures for the registration of voters and the preparation of the PNVR in Zanzibar, and then to identify any factors that may have discouraged or blocked the registration of eligible voters. Finally, recommendations were made for improving the voter registration process for future elections in Zanzibar.

The study comprised: a desk review of material from around the election period from the media, political parties and other election stakeholders; a review of statistical material such as census figures and registration & voting statistics to identify trends over time; meetings with ZEC, parties and other stakeholders; a procedural review of ZAN-ID registration, PNVR registration and the requirements for documentation before voters can be authorized to register; and finally a programme of interviews in the field with a range of eligible voters that did not register to vote. These interviews were held in all the districts of both Pemba and Unguja, in both urban and rural locations, and will included voters from marginalized groups. The study found that the institutional and legal arrangement had undermined the voter registration process in significant ways, in particular the requirement for voters to hold and Zanzibar ID (ZAN-ID) and to have been continuously resident on the Isles for at least 36 months. It also revealed that a significant number of citizens obtained their ZAN-ID but did not register to vote. As with the Voter Turnout study, a key recommendation is to invest in a sustained and coordinated programme of civic and voter education to create a responsive and politically competent citizenry.

EMB final election reports and review meetings: UNDP supported NEC and ZEC to hold a series of regional and zonal workshops with election stakeholders between January and April 2011 as part of the process of preparing their final election reports. These meetings provided an opportunity for stakeholders to express their views on the electoral process, NEC and ZEC's management of the process, and the way forward for future elections. Support was also provided for translation and printing of both final election reports.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 1:

All activities critical to the 2010 elections process were delivered by UNDP on time and to requirements, in particular provision of Election Day materials (e.g. ballot boxes, ink, ballot paper), voter registration equipment and logistical support. This allowed the EMBs to focus on organizing and managing the elections process. UNDP also responded positively to many additional requests from both EMBs for, among others: support for the unplanned Zanzibar Referendum in July; extra functionality in the RMS and CMS; printing of large additional quantities of electoral guidelines; and a technical assessment of the voter registration process in Zanzibar.

The RMS and CMS software was delivered fully operational to the EMBs, and some late requests from the EMBs for additional functionality were successfully incorporated in time. On Election Day the RMS was used by NEC in 63% of the constituencies and by ZEC in 75%. The systems performed well in practice, although the late changes to the software precluded thorough testing and debugging, and cut short the training period for the Returning Officers. As a result, some of the Returning Officers reverted to the manual process for reporting results.

The Voter Interaction System was delivered fully operational, although NEC was unable to conclude negotiations with SMS providers so the system was not used. As noted by observer missions, significant technical advances were made in 2010 in results aggregation and transmission, although NEC did not effectively communicate these changes to the public.

In sum, UNDP made a major contribution to strengthening the capacities of the EMBs to conduct the elections effectively. Nearly all activities were delivered on time and the project has helped to lay a strong foundation for future elections and registration processes.

Observer organisations generally agreed that both electoral commissions managed efficiently the preparations for the election and largely guaranteed the universal suffrage. However, the political landscape shifted significantly in 2010 and the elections saw an intensified challenge to the credibility of the electoral commissions, particularly over their role in the management of results. NEC was not fully equipped to respond to this, and towards 2015 it will need to consider changes to its structure and strengthen its capacities for information dissemination and public relations.

2. Voter education initiatives mobilized to ensure that voters, particularly women and marginalized groups, are educated on the registration and voting process in time to vote

The project assisted in the development, design, delivery and management of voter education country wide by:

- Establishing Voter Education Reference Groups (VERG) chaired by NEC and ZEC to provide essential guidance and input into the process
- Producing and disseminating voter information
- Planning and implementing outreach activities



Figure 2: Results Status: Support for Voter Education (% achievement of approved results for this component)

Assistance to NEC and ZEC regarding voter education content and design: UNDP worked with EMBs to plan and undertake voter education activities. Two Voter Education Reference Groups (VERGs) were set up in Zanzibar and the Mainland by ZEC and NEC involving educational institutions and CSOs to play a consultative role on the implementation of voter education. VERGs met on a regular basis to provide advice and quality control for voter education materials.

Voter education concerning voter registration: 37 different radio spots, 10 different newspaper messages, 75,000 posters and 600,000 leaflets targeting women, youth, people with disabilities, the illiterate, as well as the general public were produced to inform voters about voter registration. An additional 3.2 million voters were registered compared to 2005.

Production of voter education materials: 1,200,000 booklets targeting women, youth and persons with disabilities as well as Citizens Guides for both the Union and Zanzibar elections were printed and distributed. 3 million posters with mobilization messages targeting women, youths, persons with disabilities and the general voting public were produced and displayed in all districts.

Production of TV and radio programmes: Voter education spots and programmes targeting youth, women, and persons with disabilities as well as general voter information programmes were produced and broadcast by the Tanzania Broadcasting Corporation (TBC) both via radio and TV. TBC granted permission for the same programmes to be aired on 26 local radio stations and five TV channels.

Youth outreach activities: During the last weeks before the elections 50 students from the School of Journalism were deployed throughout Tanzania to conduct film projections in different localities targeting youth and first time voters using the VE programmes.

Activities targeting Persons with Disabilities: 5,000 copies of all five voter education booklets for PWDs were transcribed into Braille and distributed through the Tanzania League for the Blind (TLB) and the Zanzibar National Association for the Blind. This was the first time in Tanzania that voter education material was produced in Braille. Special outreach activities for persons with disabilities were organised by the TLB, CHAWATA and JAUWUZI. Voter education TV programmes also used sign language. 5,000 sets of voter education picture cards were produced for non-literates.

Voter Education Reference Groups (VERG): Two Voter Education Reference Groups (VERGs) were established, on Zanzibar and on the Mainland by ZEC and NEC, with educational institutions and CSOs in a consultative role conducted the implementation of

voter education. VERGs met monthly to provide advice and quality control for voter education materials.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 2:

Voter Education was a key component of the project, and one in which a large amount of resources was invested. Drawing on the lessons of the 2005 elections, the strategy for 2010 was to focus on the mobilisation of voters, particularly those traditionally marginalised from political participation: women, first time voters, non-literates and people with disabilities. To maximise outreach to these groups the project mainstreamed gender and disability issues into the voter education component and used a multi-layered media campaign to benefit from the advantages of all types of media. For example, research indicated that voters in remote areas tend to access information mainly via radio rather than TV or press, so emphasis was placed on radio broadcasting via national and local networks.

The timeline for project's voter education activities was compressed due to the delayed start of the project, but a very large amount of information was distributed through overlapping media campaigns; ESP generally produced and disseminated more voter education material than planned. It is not possible to accurately calculate numbers reached by the voter education campaign but UNDP's estimate is that in excess of 70 million voter education "hits" were made, probably many more. The impact of the voter education is also difficult to determine since there were other actors in the field, so not every improvement the area of voter education or the electoral environment in general can be attributed to UNDP. Having said this, it is clear that in 2010 large advances were made in voters' understanding of the voting process, basic rules, roles and functions of the key institutions, etc. and it is encouraging that some of the largest increases were among ESP's targeted marginalized groups.

A key lesson to emerge has been the importance of starting voter education activities far in advance of Election Day (prior to voter registration), and that the task of bringing about the necessary increases in voter awareness is complicated by lack of a concerted and coordinated civic education programme between the general elections. Further, while UNDP's focus was on the production of quality, gender-sensitive and appropriate voter education materials in cooperation with the EMBs, we also learned that the reliable distribution of voter education materials to ordinary villagers is quite challenging. Tanzania is a large country with a significant proportion of its population living in remote areas poorly served by the transport infrastructure. To reach this population requires a clear strategy to be agreed in advance with the EMBs, and allocation of adequate resources.

3. Political parties able to contribute to ensuring the transparency of voter registration, monitoring of the elections events, effective election conflict resolution, and to support female candidates

UNDP's support for political parties was focused on three main areas:

- To support political parties as key actors in the elections to better exercise roles and responsibilities vis-à-vis other political competitors and different groups of voters.
- To support their participation in the electoral process and enhance understanding of electoral rules, processes and procedures.
- To increase the participation of women as voters and as political candidates (addressed in a separate section below).



The data for several targets relating to training of party agents and officials, and their subsequent performance were not fully collected by NEC and ERIS (the contracted agency), leading to partial achievement of several targets. The scheduling of some training during the campaigning period also impacted on participation rates.

Figure 3: Results Status: Support for Political Parties (% achievement of approved results for this component)

Large scale training of political party officials on the electoral framework was conducted by the Electoral Reform International Services (ERIS) with funding provided by UNDP. 5,419 representatives from all 18 political parties participated in 149 training events implemented in three roll outs and covering the electoral process including the E-day procedures, electoral laws and regulations and training and deployment of party agents. Due to the delayed start of this activity many party representatives were already engaged in campaigning and many senior party officials could not attend. Despite this, the training was well received by the political parties, who asked for further training to be provided after the elections.

Political party officials trained on how to deal with media: Training was arranged for party officials on how to deal with the media, including the role of the media in democratic development; the role of public relation officers in political communication; planning of internal and external communication as well as developing messages; writing press releases; organizing press conferences; handling radio or TV interviews; using effective communication to handle crises situations within the party, relating with the media more effectively and developing a political communication strategy.

Workshop with vulnerable groups and political parties: UNDP arranged a workshop to familiarize political parties on the needs of vulnerable groups (women, persons living with HIV/AIDS, the poor, youth). This first time event was recorded by TBC, which broadcasted it in a one-hour TV session.

Political party resource kits and flyers: The project provided 1,000 copies of various legal texts to all 18 registered political parties and 400,000 flyers explaining the role and the rights of political party agents, including dos and don'ts.

Enhanced Code of Ethics for political parties: In the process of amending the Code of Ethics for the presidential, parliamentary and councillors' elections, UNDP facilitated meetings between NEC and political parties, and provided exposure to best practices in other countries. All parties endorsed the Code, which also included an enforcement mechanism that was considered to be quite successfully applied during the electoral process. Observer missions credited the Code for increasing transparency in the process. However, there were a number of breaches of the Code, particularly during the campaigning period, when candidates used derogatory language and a number of rallies did not respect the agreed time limits. As with the media Codes of Conduct, the challenge of monitoring observance, and what sanctions can be applied, deserves further analysis.

Support to women as voters and as candidates.

UNDP collaborated with UN Women and national women's organizations to implement the following activities:

Training of women candidates: UN Women conducted training of women candidates on public speaking, campaign planning and strategies, confidence building and presentation skills, how to engage the media, community mobilization and advocacy, lobbying and understanding of political issues in the forthcoming elections. In total 798 women candidates for the parliamentary and council seats were trained in nine workshops.

Sensitization of election stakeholders on the special needs of women in elections: Conferences were held in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar to sensitize NEC and ZEC on the needs of women as voters, candidates and when working as poll workers. Conferences were also held in Zanzibar and Dar es Salaam to sensitize political parties on gender issues in particular with regard to nomination of more female candidates. In addition, UN Women and the Tanzania Gender Networking Programme (TGNP) conducted workshops for over 500 community and religious leaders to prepare a conducive environment for female candidates in the general elections in Tanzania.

Women's radio listening groups: UN Women trained 125 community radio broadcasters and distributed 1,500 solar powered radio sets to established listening groups in Tanzania. The village broadcasters, who had no expertise in radio broadcasting, were trained to record and produce election radio programmes in preparation for the general elections in Tanzania. This activity was extended into the post-election period to enable women in rural areas to access quality information on a range of governance-related issues, including the aftermath of the elections. A second series of training workshops on radio broadcasting was conducted for a further 98 community-based radio journalists and members of the women's groups. 1,500 radio sets were distributed via community radio centres and approximately 400 new women's groups were established.

Voter education materials targeting women: UNDP supported NEC and ZEC to produce a booklet titled, "Women and the 2010 Election". The booklet encouraged women to stand as candidates and women voters to turn out in large numbers on E-Day. Information was included on the requirements for a woman to be nominated, the right of women to choose candidates of their own choice, and the right of pregnant women, lactating mothers, women with disabilities and elderly women to get priority support from election administrators on E-day.

Figure 4: VE booklet targeting women

Study on women's political participation in 2010 elections: This study consisted of an extensive survey to identify the most pertinent issues that restricted women's participation in the 2010 general elections as candidates and voters, and to propose appropriate remedial measures. The Institute of Development Studies at the University of Dar es Salaam conducted the research in 8 regions. Interviews were carried out with women and men voters, women candidates for the parliamentary and



local council seats for 2010, political party leaders, representatives from the parties' women's wings, representatives from the Tanzania Women's Cross Party Platform (T-WCP) and

Tanzania Women's Parliamentary Group (TWPG), and representatives from women's organizations.

The study found that slow but positive progress has been made, but the internal structures of the political parties are a major obstacle for women candidates. Women's leadership is also still far from being fully accepted in Tanzania, leading to negative portrayals in the media of women running for office.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 3:

The training programme for political parties generally met its objectives and confrontation between parties was significantly reduced compared with 2005, which implies that the Code of Ethics was largely adhered to. Unlike in previous elections UNDP in 2010 put special emphasis on conducting training for political parties not only in the capital but in the regions and constituencies in order to strengthen political party capacity at local level. Polling agents reportedly behaved in a more organized manner than in 2005 and before, implying that UNDP's support helped the parties to be more successful in recruiting, training, deploying and supervising their polling agents. Implementation of activities under this project component proceeded smoothly and the endorsement of the Code of Ethics by all parties was a significant achievement, and one that provides a good foundation for future elections. However, the timeframe for training of the party agents was compressed. Some regional workshops had to be combined, which led to logistical challenges and shortened the intensity of the training. In a similar way to the project's media component, structural issues in the political environment remain that need to be addressed by longer term interventions, particularly relating to the considerable imbalances that exist between the larger and smaller parties, and the lack of emphasis that most parties place on supporting women to run for office and on targeting marginalized voters.

4. Key print, radio and TV media publishers and journalists are able to report transparently and without bias on the electoral process

UNDP's support for the media environment was focused on:

- Updating and strengthening the two existing Media Codes of Conduct
- Training for journalists in print and electronic media, editors, and media house executives on ethical and objective elections reporting
- Training for journalists in print and electronic media on the media's responsibility to contribute to voter and civic education; and
- Media monitoring during the months leading to the elections to provide stakeholders with an assessment of the media coverage, and an analysis of the coverage of political parties as well as gender issues and attention to women candidates.



Two planned activities were cancelled; the Journalism Awards, and small grants for journalists. The Project Board did not consider these to be priority activities given the time available for implementation. Some journalists felt they could not put all their training into practice due to the resistance of their editors.

Figure 5: Results Status: Support for Media (% achievement of approved results for this component)

Updating Media Codes of Conduct on Elections: In cooperation with the Media Council of Tanzania (MCT), Tanzania Editors' Forum (TEF) and MISA-Tanzania the project initiated a national process which resulted in a substantial improvement of the two existing media codes of conduct on the mainland and in Zanzibar. 70% of editors signed up to the updated Codes of Conduct.

Training for journalists commenced in July and ended in mid-September. In total, 18 trainers and 700 media practitioners were trained. The training was conducted by MCT for print media, Tanzania Episcopal Conference (TEC) for radio journalists, and individual consultants for TV journalists. The topics were on election coverage, unbiased reporting, and the new media code of conduct.

Media Monitoring: In order to assess the level of impartiality of Tanzanian media in the run up to the October elections, UNDP selected Synovate Tanzania to implement the independent monitoring of media in mainland and Zanzibar. Monitoring started on 1st June and continued until 15th December, with 92 media outlets monitored, including 31 radio stations (national and regional), 14 TV channels, 41 newspapers and 6 blogs. Monitoring indicated that the ruling party received the same amount of media coverage as the two main opposition parties combined. Findings can be downloaded from the following website – www.empt.co.tz. Two press conferences were held in October and November to present findings on how journalists had reported the elections and the coverage given to candidates and their parties. 3,000 copies of the final report on the Media Monitoring exercise were printed and launch events were held in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar in June 2011.

Access to news and information in remote areas: To address the relatively poor access of journalists in remote areas to election-related news, an independent journalist summarized coverage and disseminated it to upcountry electronic media, radio and TV stations. News summaries were made from 16 daily and weekly newspapers, among them five English language newspapers, and compiled in a newsletter format entitled Habari za Uchaguzi (Election News), which was emailed on a daily basis over September to November to about 60 radio and TV stations each with between 500,000 and 10 million listeners/viewers. These broadcasters used the material to prepare daily programmes on the elections and also for evening news bulletins. Given the clear demand for balanced coverage of current affairs in rural areas, UNDP continued this activity until June 2011, and held workshops to obtain feedback from 140 journalists on how to improve the newsletter. A second version was launched, with wider coverage of issues related to governance, women's rights, civic education and constitutional reform, as well as political issues raised during the elections period. Distribution was broadened to include members of the women's radio listening groups. Press articles on the activities of recently elected women, and issues of interest to women voters (such as service provision, legal reforms and women in politics) were also included.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 4:

Activities to support the media environment generally proceeded very smoothly and all activities were completed on time. Journalists are an easily identified and accessible group thus UNDP encountered no difficulties in implementing training activities and the development of the Codes of Conduct, and in general the project achieved its targets for planned meetings, workshops and training. Two activities did not proceed: the Journalism Awards, which was not considered a priority activity, and the grant making facility for local journalists, for which there was insufficient time to design and launch prior to the elections.

Although UNDP's delivery under the media component encountered few challenges, structural issues do persist in the media sector that demand long term support and

intervention. These include payment of journalists for coverage, the lack of independence of media houses from political parties and business interests, the lack of analytical coverage and issues-based reporting, or the lack of a 'national discourse' (the discussion of specific issues involving multiple media outlets). Many of these issues are raised in Synovate's media monitoring reports, which generated debate and comment in the press. UNDP used the launch of the final media monitoring report to facilitate a discussion around the same issues. The adoption of revised Media Codes of Conduct for both Zanzibar and the mainland was an important achievement however there were many infringements during the elections period, which highlights the question of how the Codes should be enforced, and how quick corrective action could be taken on breaches. This was also one of the key topics for discussion during the launch of the media monitoring report.

5. Key civil society networks and specialized organizations supported to enhance participation and promote fairness in the electoral process

Activities to support attainment of this output were integrated into other project components. As project targets have set under each project component, results against targets relevant to this output are reported under other sections.

Key project activities to support civil society networks were the following:

Voter Education Grants Facility (VEGF): 43 CSOs were selected from 595 applications through an open, competitive process to conduct voter education outreach activities throughout the country from August to October. Activities included road shows, sports events, musical events, and town hall meetings, among others. CSO activities focused on the following target groups: women, youth, persons with disabilities, people in remote area or with limited access to information. Deloitte estimated that 18,748,250 voter education contacts (45% women) were made through the CSOs' outreach activities.

Empowerment of women's associations and other networks to promote the role of women in elections: UNDP, UNIFEM and the Tanzania Women Lawyers' Association (TAWLA) conducted workshops for 360 members of women's associations and other networks to promote the role of women in elections. The aim was to raise awareness of the roles women's networks and other CSOs should play to ensure equal participation of men and women in the electoral process.

Support for national election observation: UNDP funded the Tanzanian Election Monitoring Committee (TEMCO) to carry out domestic election observation. TEMCO, a network of 152 CSOs, deployed 7,350 short-term observers and 223 long-term observers to observe political campaigns, polling, counting and results aggregation. This was a significant increase over the 2005 elections, when only 1,500 observers were deployed.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 5:

Training and deployment of domestic observers was the single most important activity supported by UNDP under this component. This progressed smoothly once launched, but due to the time taken to complete the procurement process the nomination period could not be covered by these observers. Although TEMCO performed well, it could have benefitted from further capacity building in the form of actual technical assistance from the project, particularly on how to improve its methodology and information collection.

Strong emphasis on management of risk and a transparent and rigorous grantee selection process meant that the VEGF was launched later than expected. Risk was managed very well by the grants manager (Deloitte), and indeed no funds were lost through mismanagement by the grantees. However, the time available for delivery of voter education became compressed, and this affected the impact of the VEGF. Good capacity development

of grantees was provided by Deloitte on grants and financial management, but due to the limited time available training could not be provided in other areas - such as advocacy techniques – which would have benefitted the CSOs.



6. Electoral Management Bodies supported with capacity and resources to effectively coordinate Elections Observation missions

All targets were met under this output, and no significant challenges were encountered in implementation. Participation of national observers increased five-fold compared to 2005.

Figure 6: Results Status: Support for Election Observation (% achievement of approved results for this component)

Amendment of the Code of Conduct for observers: UNDP provided assistance to NEC and ZEC in amending the Guidelines for Local and International Observers. A workshop was held with the EMBs in June 2010 to discuss current international standards for election observation. Amendments to the Code were made mainly in the areas of do's and don'ts, the duration of observation and reporting requirements with a focus on strengthening observers' rights.

Observer Support Centres: UNDP established two Observer Support Centres in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar in cooperation with NEC and ZEC. The centres were used as accreditation centres and access to the internet, meeting rooms and information kits were made available to the observers. i) Accreditation materials: 4,535 local and international observers (3,154 in Dar es Salaam and 1,381 in Zanzibar) were accredited at the observer centres with the ID materials procured by UNDP. ii) Information kits for observers: UNDP assisted both EMBs in providing information kits for the observers. For the Union elections, 300 T-shirts and caps, 500 bags and 11,400 copies of various legal documents for the observers were procured and printed by UNDP. For the Zanzibar elections 2,700 folders and 20,600 copies of various documents were procured and printed by UNDP.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 6:

Overall, there were no significant challenges in implementing the activities under this component. Observer missions and groups gave positive feedback on the Observer Support Centres set up by the project with the EMBs, particularly the information and observer kits provided. Printing of the information kits was delayed for two main reasons, because the documents were not finalised by EMBs until the last moment, and there was a technical issue with the contracting of the printing company. All in all, these constraints did not significantly affect implementation of the activities under this component.

7. Electoral Management Bodies and other key stakeholders supported in the promotion of a secure and peaceful environment during the electoral process.



Nearly all targets were met under this output, highlights being support provided to the Police, and improved communication between election stakeholders.

Mapping of risks prior to the elections proved challenging because relevant bodies were reluctant to release data, and data actually held on conflict is also incomplete.

Figure 7: Results Status: Secure and peaceful elections environment (% achievement of approved results for this component)

Confidence building and dialogue: Seven conferences took place during the months prior to the elections in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar in which all election stakeholders were invited to commit to peaceful elections. One post-election conference on lessons learned also took place in Zanzibar. On the mainland and in Zanzibar the project facilitated two meetings between the Tanzanian Police Force (TPF) and political parties which built up confidence and particularly in Zanzibar resulted in a close cooperation regarding the security situation. Through the Office of the Mufti of Zanzibar (OMZ) 62 community meetings on grass root level were arranged in Zanzibar during the last two weeks of the elections to promote a peaceful polling day and acceptance of results. As a governmental institution responsible for coordinating and organizing Islamic religious affairs and the religious leadership in Zanzibar, the OMZ has conducted many large scale community projects throughout the Isles, with a particular focus on promoting peace and harmony. This made it the natural partner for conducting the community dialogue process, which aimed to encourage communities to exercise political tolerance and participate peacefully in the July referendum and the general election.

Incident Reporting & Response System: UNDP supported the Tanzania Police Force (TPF) to establish two Joint Command and Communication Centres (JCCC) in Dar es Salaam and Zanzibar where police coordinated its operations. Linked to the JCCCs is an Incident Reporting and Response System which uses GIS technology for reporting and recording incidents. The project upgraded TPF's radio communication capacity through the provision of 1450 VHF handheld sets for officers on the ground; 140 mobile VHF & GPS sets for rapid response vehicles; 28 long range HF sets for district level stations; 13 solar power stations, and a large stock of spare parts to maintain functionality of the system for several years.

Phase 1 (12 identified hotspot areas) was completed prior to E-Day, and the remaining 124 sites were completed between January and October 2011. It is already clear is that TPF is benefitting from a dramatic increase in radio coverage country-wide, and this has significantly boosted its capacity to report, respond and direct operations. Before the IRRS, HF coverage was partial and VHF limited to regional towns only. After deployment of the system, HF coverage is now 100% nationally, and VHF coverage has been extended to 30kms around the district towns, rising to 60-100kms using the vehicle based units. Data from 10 regions

show a 27% increase in reporting of incidents of all types since deployment of the IRRS. The incident tracking software modified by UNDP from the *Ushahidi*¹ platform has provided TPF with unprecedented ability to record and classify incidents reported from the field level, coordinate response and track resolution. Furthermore, the software enables TPF to build up a database of incidents over time, which can be used to inform the allocation of resources to prevent future violence. A screenshot of the system appears below:



Figure 8: screenshot of incident tracking software now in use by TPF

Training of Police: i) Together with the Commission for Human Rights and Good Governance and the Legal Sector Reform Programme the project initiated large scale training for police officers at the ward level on <u>Human Rights and the Role of Police in Elections</u>. More than 4,450 officers (794 of them women, 18%) in all districts of 23 regions participated in the one-day training. ii) In cooperation with the British police the project conducted three <u>Public Order courses</u> for police commanders and police trainers. The training familiarised TPF officers with modern policing techniques, community mediation, and non-lethal tactics for dealing with riots and unrest, and built on longer-term capacity development implemented by other programmes with the police. The positive impact of this training was visible during the incidents which occurred during the campaigning and the results aggregation. Contrary to the 2005 elections, the police was seen as an impartial force and one main opposition party even publically voiced their satisfaction with the professional and impartial attitude of the police during the election period.

Study on incidents of election-related violence in 2010: This study aimed to improve understanding of the nature and dynamics of election-related violence in Tanzania, and to support the development of strategic measures and mitigating policy to minimize their political impact in future electoral events. The study's findings should therefore provide important inputs for the design of future programmes of electoral support in Tanzania.

Through a combination of desk research, interviews with key informants and data collection from the field, reported incidents of violence that occurred during the 2010 electoral process on the mainland and in Zanzibar were mapped, profiled and analysed. The actual/potential

¹ Ushahidi is open source software developed in the aftermath of the 2007 Kenyan elections enabling data reported from multiple locations to be plotted onto GIS-based maps, which are updated in real time. There have been numerous applications of this 'crowdsourcing' technology, including mapping incidents of electoral violence, monitoring stocks in local dispensaries, etc.

impact of these tensions, incidents, violence or conflicts in the preparation of future elections were assessed and concrete and implementable measures recommended to prevent and mitigate incidents in future electoral events. The study was conducted in 12 locations where the highest number of incidents has been reported, covering the period from six months before Election Day on 31st October 2010 until the inauguration dates of the new governments (November 2010). The study identified the principal contributors of tensions to be delays in results declaration, the lack of transparency in vote aggregation, and inflammatory language used by campaigning candidates. A critical factor is the credibility and independence of the EMBs in the eyes of voters and political parties. It recommended the establishment of bodies for electoral dispute management and resolution, and programmes of civic and voter education, with youth as a key target group.

Documentation of lessons learned on conflict prevention and community dialogue in 2010: This activity consisted of documenting and assessing UNDP's experience in conflict prevention and peace building (CPPB) in Zanzibar since 2009. It also provided recommendations for UN/UNDP CPPB approaches; and for programming over the UNDAP period of 2011-2015. Information was sourced from different levels in ZEC (Commissioners, Chairman's Office and the executive staff), from the House of Representatives (both the staff and the members of the House), various government agencies (especially the Office of the Second Vice President through the Principal Secretary and the Office of the Cabinet in the Revolutionary Council), from political parties, CSOs, youth and women's groups as well as some ordinary citizens in rural communities.

Conclusions on attainment of Output 7:

Nearly all activities under this component were successfully delivered although with some delays. Implementation of the risk assessment using a survey tool was not fully realized due to security concerns and timing, since both the LEAs and the EMBs were engaged in preparing for the elections. The Steering Committee's approval process delayed the start of procurement for the IRRS, leaving little time for roll out. In the event, UNDP procured all equipment on time and TPF managed to install the 12 agreed priority locations prior to the elections. The impact of the IRRS will be clearer over the longer term as TPF builds up a database of incident reports over time and data becomes accessible. However, it has been stated by TPF that the availability of more accurate information from the ground did enable the LEAs to assign their resources only where needed and so to minimize their presence in public in 2010. Certainly, the LEAs managed to adopt a much lower profile in 2010 than in previous election years, and this undoubtedly played a part in reducing tensions.

UNDP also made a significant investment in a series of security dialogue meetings between election stakeholders, an approach pioneered in 2005. In Zanzibar the over-riding factor on maintaining a peaceful environment was the agreement between the two main parties to form a Government of National Unity. However, the meetings held between the LEAs, the EMBs, the parties and other groups on the rules of engagement were welcomed by many and seen as an indicator of a shift in attitude on the part of the LEAs.

III. PERFORMANCE REVIEW

1. PROGRESS REVIEW

This section assesses the overall progress of the project towards different development outcomes and the overall capacity development process.

(i) Overall progress towards the CPAP outcome

The CPAP outcome for 2007-2011 targeted by the project was:

"Strengthened political, parliamentary and electoral systems that enhance effective participation and representation, bearing in mind gender considerations, and greater political tolerance, oversight and credible elections".

The finding of the independent evaluation of ESP in this regard was that the project has had "a **significant impact** on its democratic governance objectives". Project achievements highlighted in the evaluation report that contributed to attainment of the CPAP outcome included:

- ESP contributed and enabled the EMBs to conduct the electoral process in a credible manner under peaceful conditions.
- The EMBs now have systems which enable them to produce and publish results transparently and quickly.
- The update of the voter register well ahead of the elections was key to promoting transparency and credibility in the electoral process.
- The holding of a successful Referendum was duly attributed to ZEC, who were for the first time perceived as neutral and transparent which inevitably had a positive effect.
- Voter education afforded by the project could be attributed to the reduction in the number of spoilt ballots.
- ESP's promotion of women's nomination as candidates had a positive impact, and there was an increase in the number of female candidates who nominated themselves.
- In Zanzibar, where elections have long been marred by violence, a dialogue for peace process with broad participation of election stakeholders provided opportunities for improved understanding and a foundation for peaceful resolution of differences.
- The agreed absence of Special Forces and the deployment of the IRRS enabled LEAs to keep a low profile during the elections, helped to reduce tensions and contributing to a more positive perception of the police who hitherto were considered to be partisan.

Furthermore, the evaluation found that UNDP's support was broadly effective and relevant, and that financial investments were justified in light of benefits. The principal challenge the project faced was the compressed implementation period. In this regard the evaluation noted that the impact of several activities would have been greater had the lead-in time been longer, and the duration of activities had been extended to ensure longer-term benefits.

(ii) Capacity development

A key component of the technical assistance provided by the project was to "strengthen the organizational, management and operational capacities of NEC/ZEC to enable these key institutions to better plan, prepare, conduct, manage and supervise the elections in 2010". The evaluation mission found that "*There is no doubt that both EMBs have been enabled to strengthen their operational capacities and the impact has been largely positive.*"

Substantial technological updates were provided, especially for the EMBs and TPF, which will have a sustained effect on institutional capacity. Major examples include: the RMS and CMS software; new data storage for the PNVR & operating system; upgrading of NEC's warehouse; the VR kits; and, radio communication equipment for the TPF. The evaluation found that these upgrades were *"both successful in their implementation and provide for long term sustainability"*.

A great deal of training was also provided, targeting all of the main election stakeholders. Key examples include: training of Police officers, CSOs, political parties, women candidates, journalists, national observers, and the judiciary. Pre and post evaluation tests showed that in nearly all cases knowledge and awareness of participants increased. However, as noted by the evaluation, the overall impact and subsequent sustainability of much of the training provided could have been greater if more time was available for lead-in and follow through on these activities by UNDP.

A good understanding of the capacity development needs of both target groups and partner institutions will enable better definition of project strategies for engaging them. It is recommended that strategies for reaching disadvantaged groups such as PWDs, youth and the rural poor are formulated through consultation with the CSO networks that represent them. With respect to the capacities of the EMBs it has to be acknowledged that it takes time to develop a good understanding of an organization's real development needs, and that lasting staff development also requires more time than is commonly assumed. To this end, only so much could be expected from a short term project, and there is a good case for placing a small team of one or two advisers at least two years prior to elections to conduct capacity development for the middle and senior management of NEC and ZEC.

(iii) Gender mainstreaming

Gender disparities in the political process emerged as a recurring theme from the consultations and from the 2005 process. The project attempted to address these challenges by placing a particular emphasis on women in rural areas, sensitization of political parties to incorporate women into politics, and the training of women candidates.

UNDP addressed the needs of women voters through a twin-track approach. Gender was treated as a cross-cutting issue in the implementation of all activities in the ESP Work Plan, and women voters are one of the four main disadvantaged groups targeted by the project². It was also recognized that women within the other disadvantaged groups can face multiple forms of discrimination and marginalization; for example, women with disabilities. Beyond that a number of specific activities were designed to support women as candidates and as voters, which was a recommendation of the Needs Assessment Mission.

The project developed a comprehensive M&E framework which included clear indicators for measuring the increased participation of women and other marginalized groups in the electoral process. The inclusion of a Gender Specialist in the project personnel was a major factor in successful mainstreaming of gender issues. This person was responsible for supporting gender mainstreaming across all components, and advising component leaders on activity design and data collection.

The overall budget for activities targeting <u>women only</u> was at least USD 2,000,000 or 7% of the overall project budget. The main activities were:

- Support provided to women as candidates
- Sensitization of the EMBs, political parties, journalists and religious groups on the special needs of women in elections
- Voter education for women
- Empowerment of women's associations and other networks to promote the role of women in elections
- A study on women's political participation as voters and candidates in 2010.

In addition to the above activities women were reached through activities that involved both women and men voters, and where specific components were included to target women voters' interests and needs. A good illustration of this is the Voter Education Grants Facility, which reached recorded approximately 18,750,000 voter education contacts through projects implemented by CSOs. Of these, some 3,000,000 contacts were with women, reached

 $^{^2}$ Women, youth & first time voters, people with disabilities, non-literates. Rural and urban disadvantaged groups, and PLWHA were also targeted in a number of activities.

through women-only activities, and a further 7,350,000 through activities targeting disadvantaged groups.

The project evaluation found that the mainstreaming of gender throughout the project components led to a positive impact on women's participation in the electoral process. Women's registration increased, as did the number of nominees and candidates in the parliamentary elections. Furthermore, NEC adopted a policy of recruiting women poll workers whereby nearly half of their Election Day workers were women.

(iv) Human Rights mainstreaming

The Human Rights Based Approach was clearly apparent in the project's implementation strategy, and in the activities supported:

Participation: the project emphasized facilitating participation, consultation and dialogue between a broad range of election stakeholders.

Disadvantaged groups: activities across all project components targeted specific marginalized groups suffering different forms of discrimination; these were: women, youth and first time voters, people with disabilities, and non-literates. Rural and urban disadvantaged groups, and PLWHA were also targeted through a number of activities. Not only were these groups directly targeted but other groups such as political parties, religious and community leaders, and law enforcement agencies were sensitized on the needs of disadvantaged groups.

Building awareness of rights and laws. For example, through: large scale dissemination of electoral regulations and Codes of Conduct; workshops and conferences across all project components with election stakeholders that included presentations on international standards and national and international rights and laws; voter education materials; newsletters, etc.

Support for reform of legal frameworks: UNDP supported review, amendments, printing and dissemination of the electoral regulations and guidelines, the Media Codes of Conduct, the Code of Conduct for Observers, and the Code of Ethics for political parties. In all cases, UNDP provided technical support to help align regulations and guidelines with international standards. Particular attention was given to supporting the participation of persons with disabilities and pregnant women in the voting process.

Reduction and prevention of violence: the project facilitated of dialogue among election stakeholders, particularly in Zanzibar, encouraging respect for human rights, tolerance of difference, and peaceful resolution of disputes. Significant support was provided to the Police and the various Special Forces on Zanzibar in the form of programmes of training on Public Order, policing during the elections, human rights, community mediation and non-lethal tactics for containing public disorder.

(v) **Communication and publicity**

At the launch of the project UNDP and implementing partners agreed a Visibility Plan with a view to increasing public awareness of project experiences, achievements and knowledge products, and the assistance of the international community for the electoral process.

The project personnel included a Media & Communication Specialist to support production of a range of publicity materials for the project. Project activities and results were communicated through the following products:

ESP newsletter: 15 editions of this monthly newsletter were circulated to about 400 contacts in government, political parties, CSOs, the press, etc. The newsletter provided highlights of project activity and any key achievements.

Project website: hosted on UNDP Tanzania's website: http://www.tz.undp.org/esp/index.asp

Press releases: four press releases were made at key junctures in the project.

Articles: these appeared on UNDP's global website, UNDP Tanzania's website and in local press.

Project fact sheet: summarizing the project in two pages.

Daily newsletter: providing summarized local press coverage of the elections and broader governance and circulated to community level journalists and broadcasters five times a week over 6 months, before and after the elections.

Briefings: were provided by the RC on a monthly basis to a group of Ambassadors in Dar es Salaam.

Brochure: the results, achievements and main lessons from the project and previous support for elections provided by UNDP in Tanzania are being documented in a project brochure.

Examples of the above communications products appear in Annex 2.

2. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY REVIEW

This section assesses the quality of the implementation strategy looking at the quality of the consultative process, the quality of partnerships and the extent to which the project has endeavored to ensure national ownership and sustainability.

(i) **Sustainability**

Sustainability for future elections was an important principle throughout all technical assistance provided by UNDP, in particular with regard to procurement of equipment and materials, and ICT assistance.

The project provided two types of technical assistance. Firstly, investments in technology were made; for example, upgrading of the EMBs' hardware and software, upgrading of the voter registration kits, development of the RMS and CMS systems, and deployment of the IRRS with the TPF. Secondly, many of the other interventions were to support capacity and institution building of both EMBs and to a lesser degree the media, domestic observation and civil society.

A cornerstone in these efforts was the introduction of an assets management system for NEC, ZEC and the Tanzanian Police Force. The user-friendly web based Asset Management System (AMS) has modules for receiving and inspection, handovers, custodians, locations and comprehensive reporting. These functions make it far easier to track and to support the movement of assets from one location to another, and should make a significant contribution to minimizing loss or theft of equipment.

The CMS and RMS were of course developed around the EMBs' specifications for the 2010 elections, and as mentioned above, can be modified by the EMBs themselves to cater for future requirements. The IRRS builds on existing, proven radio communications technology and processes already used for many years by TPF, and there is little immediate prospect of this technology becoming redundant. As such, there is a very good chance that the system will continue to provide benefits from now to the 2015 elections and beyond. Prior to embarking on major investments in new technology, thorough assessments were made beforehand to confirm the need, the appropriate solution and value for money. Examples include the feasibility study conducted prior to upgrading the VR kits, and the value for money assessment conducted prior to design of the IRRS for the Police.

The evaluation mission found that "In the main, the enhanced technological updates have both been successful in their implementation and provide for long term sustainability".

Ideally, these interventions should have targeted at the same time the behavioral and institutional working of the institutions they were intended to benefit. The fact that some of the activities were by design short-term and were also implemented very close to the elections means that behavioral change has probably only been experienced at a superficial level, and a longer term approach would be needed to have had more of a sustainable impact.

(ii) **Participatory/consultative processes**

During the design stage, in-depth discussions with both EMBs as well as lessons learned arising from DDTP were incorporated into the project document in relation to the type of assistance to be afforded to the EMBs. Furthermore, as is customary when shaping a project of this scale, and due to the on-going and/or future interest in the electoral process, a number of different stakeholders were consulted. These included the relevant ministries, political parties, civil society, the Police, women's groups and other organisations from marginalized groups.

As mentioned above, Voter Education Reference Groups (VERGs) were established on Zanzibar and on the mainland, hosted by ZEC and NEC and comprised of CSOs, educational institutions and elections officers. VERGs met monthly to review voter education materials drafted by UNDP with NEC and ZEC, and provide advice on strategies and activities, to ensure that materials produced with the project's support reflected the correct priorities and messages.

A Steering Committee (SC) was set up which met every two months and two Technical Committees (TC) were established which were to serve the mainland and Zanzibar respectively. Both SC and TC Committees were inclusive of the key stakeholders, although all the political parties were represented in the Steering Committee by only one senior official from the Tanzanian Centre for Democracy. This was actually the arrangement agreed with the parties themselves, but it may not have provided for an effective flow of information and views between the project and the political parties.

(iii) Quality of partnerships

The project's main national counterparts were the two EMBs, NEC and ZEC. As mentioned earlier, the EMBs participated in the entire project process, including design, planning and resource allocation, decision-making and evaluation. The principal focus of project support was also to reinforce the capacities of the EMBs to deliver the elections process effectively and credibly. On the whole, the partnership between the project and the EMBs was constructive and effective. The limited staffing capacity and centralized decision-making structures of both EMBs did pose a challenge for UNDP and the EMBs alike, since they had limited ability to engage with the project and respond quickly to requests for information, confirmation of requirements and technical specifications. This was particularly the case in the months approaching the elections. Embedding project staff with the EMBs would have improved information flows and coordination, and facilitated trust and understanding. Any future programme of assistance will need to focus on closer integration and fuller alignment with the processes, structures and schedules of the EMBs.

Besides the EMBs, the project worked through partnerships with a broad range of election stakeholders, as has already been outlined; several of these were agencies had also been

involved in the 2005 ESP, and others were entirely new. Some of the key partnerships were with:

- Media organisations, for example with MISA-TAN and Media Council of Tanzania for the training of journalists.
- The Police, through development and deployment of the IRRS, and the various programmes of training of police officers.
- CSOs (both national and international) and CSO networks; for example TEMCO, which was contracted to train and deploy 7000 national observers, and is itself a coalition of 152 CSOs.
- Government agencies, for example the Commission on Human Rights and Good Governance, which was contracted to monitor the training of police officers in human rights. Also the Office of the Mufti, which facilitated the dialogue for peace process in Zanzibar.
- Academia: UNDP commissioned several research studies from different departments at the University of Dar es Salaam.
- UN agencies: UN Women delivered the women's radio listening groups activity with the involvement of UNESCO, and also delivered the programme of training of women candidates.

The involvement of such a broad range of institutions and organisations was a major strength of the 2010 ESP. In several cases, the partnership in 2010 has certainly provided a good basis for future collaboration. One area can be highlighted where a more intensive engagement would have been beneficial, and that is with political parties. Although assistance provided by the project was planned in line with what was agreed with the political parties, the project could have interacted and briefed them more intensively, perhaps through scheduled information sharing meetings. Studies commissioned by UNDP, as well as comment in the press, have also identified several critical issues relating to the parties' performance, particularly capacities for policy analysis, resource mobilization, internal organization and coordination, and promotion of gender equity. These weaknesses will need to be addressed through longer term capacity development interventions.

(iv) National ownership

Although ESP was a direct implementation (DIM) project, the design and implementation aimed to enhance national ownership and leadership. As mentioned above, consultation with national institutions took place following the 2005 elections and also at the design stage of the 2010 ESP. During implementation, technical assistance was planned and provided to both EMBs according to their requests and specifications. The EMBs were fully involved in the design of the project, in planning and resource allocation, setting priorities, decision making, and reporting to the Project Board. The project could have involved the EMBs more in monitoring project activities, but since both EMBs are short of staff this would probably not have been practical. ZEC may have assumed assistance from UNDP would be provided in a similar way to the DDTP - which was a NIM project - and so was expecting more direct involvement in implementation.

Several important project inputs were developed with national ownership in mind from the design stage. For example, the RMS and CMS software was based entirely on the requirements of the EMBs, and developed in close collaboration with their IT personnel. UNDP ensured that the EMBs hold the source code and also have the technical skills to make further modifications to meet evolving needs. Developing the systems in-house gave UNDP the flexibility to alter its functionality according to the evolving requirements from the EMBs. The Incident Reporting and Response System developed with TPF, the training of journalists by the Media Council of Tanzania, and the deployment of national observers by TEMCO are other good examples of the same approach.

3. MANAGEMENT EFFECTIVENESS REVIEW

This section assesses the effectiveness of the project management structure in terms of cost-effectiveness, timeliness, and quality of monitoring.

(i) Monitoring and Evaluation

UNDP elaborated a detailed M&E framework with clear indicators, benchmarks and time lines. The framework has three core indicator tables: a Results & Indicator Framework; a Results Monitoring Matrix, and a Results Report, which facilitates periodic reporting against the agreed project results. The figure below provides an example:

	by gender¤						
2. Wider supply of Media Election Coverage (Activity 3.10-3.11) (Note <3.11 cancelled>) ^[1]							
C.1.a Number of daily news summaries prepared and	a) Arrangements in place to compile election news summaries b) Recipient local radio	click in box that best matches planned progress \mathbb{C} a b c d \mathbb{C} By the end of this month we	click in box that best matches actual progress \mathbb{C} a b c d \mathbb{C}	Where appropriate, explain why there is a difference between planned and actual III	Identify priority activities for the next month □ □ □ □		
distributed G. 1. b. Bronneting	broadcasters identified \P	expected	see a				
C.1.b Proportion of targeted local broadcasters that	Target: at least 30 local broadcasters identified अ	п	п				
are using the summaries¤	c) Daily production and distribution underway I						
	Target: daily summaries distributed over 70 days between August 1 st and November 15th अ						
	d) Recipients use summaries in local news broadcasts @						
	Target: At least 20 local broadcasters make use of these summaries¤						

Figure 8: Results report template from M&E framework

ESP staff, supported by an M&E specialist, were chiefly responsible for monitoring the progress of the activities under their respective components. Staff gathered information on a continual basis as they went about their project routines, and Component teams gathered their information on a monthly basis to prepare a results report.

The M&E framework provided clear targets to be achieved, the monitoring process to be followed, and clarified roles and responsibilities at different levels within the project. It was undoubtedly a high quality tool that enabled systematic and detailed monitoring and reporting. However, the practical application of the M&E framework in a project with 130 separate activities proved quite challenging. The M&E Specialist tasked with coordinating implementation of the M&E framework in the project only arrived in post in May 2010, and the final version of the M&E framework was launched the following month. This gave the project little time to embed the practices and the discipline required for the M&E framework to really deliver as envisaged. A further problem was the lack of available baseline data in many of the fields targeted by the project activities; this made it difficult for the project to set accurate targets. As a consequence, a number of targets were reported as partially achieved when the project, and the beneficiaries, considered the activities to be fully successful.

(ii) **Timely delivery of outputs**

As noted in the evaluation mission report, the foremost challenge faced by the project was the delayed start. UNDP moved from the planning to implementation stage only in mid-March 2010, less than 8 months before the elections in October. This obviously impacted on the delivery of many planned activities, and so to a certain degree on the project outputs. A number of activities from the principal, pre-election work plan were also postponed until the post-election phase as they were not considered absolute priorities to complete before the elections. An example was the upgrading of NEC's warehouses and IT infrastructure.

The reasons for delayed implementation in the project were:

- Slow recruitment of key project personnel, which was as a consequence of the introduction of new UN-wide regulations on procurement and recruitment in June 2009, coinciding with the start of the project.
- Late approval of the AWP, which meant that procurement could not commence until 10th March 2010, when the Steering Committee formally approved the AWP.
- The absence of timely responses from the EMBs in relation to finalizing technical and other related specifications for items to be procured or delivered.
- The high volume of additional project-related recruitment, procurement and processing of payments place a heavy burden on the Country Office.

As a result, the lead-in time for procurement and implementation of many activities was not always adequate. Some synergies between activities were lost, and in some cases the expected benefits and outcomes were not fully realized. Nevertheless, the project was able to deliver on time and within the budget and achieved a high level of results (77 per cent of targets were achieved, 22 per cent partially achieved and 1 per cent not achieved). Factors that contributed to this successful delivery include:

- A dedicated Project Management Unit operating with sufficient autonomy, and with oversight and support provided by the Country Office.
- The choice of Direct Implementation modality meant that resources and decisionmaking authority were brought together.
- Effective project governance arrangements: the combined oversight of a Technical Committee for detailed scrutiny and technical discussion, with strategic guidance provided through a Steering Committee.
- Constructive partnerships with the project's donors, and their sustained engagement.

The project duration was extended once, from July to October 2011. This was endorsed by the Project Board in June 2011 in order to allow sufficient time for remaining activities in the post-election work plan to be completed. A number of these activities were complex or sensitive and it took some time before agreement could be reached on the best approach for implementation, particularly since the project aimed to emphasize national ownership of these activities. Examples included: the upgrading of NEC's warehouse, and the study on Incidents of Election-Related Violence.

(iii) Cost-effective use of inputs

The project was of two year duration with a budget of approximately USD28,700,000, which was sufficient in relation to the scope of the project. Total project income received by UNDP was USD28,018,323, disbursed as shown in Table 1 below.



Table 1: ESP – Expenditure: Budgeted/Actual to date/Projected to the end of Project

The independent evaluation included an assessment of value for money from two perspectives: whether procurement procedures ensured value for money, and whether the benefits derived from investments made by the project were in line with what it cost to produce them. It should be noted that, as with many projects aiming to intervene in processes of social and political change, many benefits cannot be quantified, and many may not be immediately apparent. However, this assessment concluded that *"The costs attached to the project were justified by the overall benefits derived, noting that many of the benefits and contributing factors could not be quantified"*. Although direct comparisons with other countries need to be treated with caution, the cost per voter in Tanzania (\$12.30), and the cost per registrant (\$6.60) were also found to be approximately in line with similar sized elections in the region, taking into account the contributions of both UNDP and the Government of Tanzania to the 2010 elections.

The evaluation also noted that competitive procurement of equipment had consistently ensured value for money, and there were a number of cases where UNDP obtained high quality equipment or services at the best price. For example in the case of the Voter Registration Grant Facility (VEGF), Deloitte allocated a large staff component and staff time at a relatively low price. Due to the large scale of procurement for elections globally a competitive and efficient market already exists for elections materials, and again, in several cases UNDP obtained very good value for money. Where costs for a particular item were found to be above market rates, procurement was cancelled or re-commenced.

IV. IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES

This section is a concise analysis of the main implementation issues that were generic to the project and not related to a specific output or activity; and adjustments performed to address these issues.

#	Description	Date Identified	Туре	Impact & Priority 1 (low) to 5 (high)	Countermeasures / Management response
1	Project design did not foresee dedicated staff to lead Components 3, 4 and 5: media, political parties and observation	Mar 2010	Problem	PM unable to absorb management of these tasks. Priority = 2	Senior staff and UNVs were designated as Component Leaders.
2	Lengthy procurement processes, few LTAs in place.	Mar 2010	Problem	Procurements had to be prioritized, but most processes achieved at last moment with no room for modification. Priority = 1	Detailed planning of major procurements. All procurement staff located together in PMU. Intensive liaison with CO and regional bureaux.
3	Late arrival of project staff	Mar 2010	Problem	Delays in implementation, additional burden on existing staff. Priority = 1	ESP diverted support to CO recruitment of remaining national staff, and nearly all consultants. Responsibilities in the PMU were reorganized in the interim.
4	Overburdened capacities for procurement, finance and HR support.	June 2010	Problem	Delays in processing of payments to suppliers, approval of POs, etc. Priority = 2	Realignment of project staff responsibilities.
5	Uneven/unpredictable engagement of EMBs due to staffing limitations	Aug 2010	Problem	Slow finalization of specifications and requirements delayed launch of procurement, made planning of activities more difficult. Priority = 2	PM to raise with EMBs, Component Leaders to persist diplomatically

Access provided in mid April 2010.

secondment/support from experienced

Coaching of project staff and

CO staff.

				Priority = 2	
7	Separation of the PMU from the country office and the EMBs.	Aug 2010	Problem	Coordination and rapid implementation made more difficult. Priority = 3	Processes became more streamlined over time, esp. after SOPs agreed. PMU finally relocated to CO.
3	Establishment of PMU time- consuming. Many problems with power, internet, phones, etc.	July 2010	Problem	Attention diverted from project activities to resolving practical issues with PMU office, some critical.	All issues solved one by one over time. PMU relocated to CO upon scaling down of staff towards project closure.
	Need for clear SOPs for the project.	Feb 2010	Problem	Risk of confusion and coordination problems, resulting in delays. Priority = 2	Detailed SOPs covering all project business processes were finalised in May 2010 to ensure clear procedures for internal control.
0	Some project staff capacities and experience limited; most staff new to elections and to UNDP.	July 2010	Problem	Increased burden on experienced staff members. Priority = 2	A degree of on the job coaching was possible.

Payments initially processed by CO

Delays to processing payments, no

staff unfamiliar with the project.

direct control.

ATLAS:

1. No project access to ATLAS

experienced with ATLAS

2. Project staff insufficiently

6

June 2010

Problem

V. LESSONS LEARNED

Related CPAP Outcome			
	Project Description and Key Lessons-Learned		
Brief description of context / development problems	 Significantly different political landscapes in Zanzibar and the mainland. Insecurity and volatility throughout previous election periods in Zanzibar. Weak opposition parties on mainland with limited presence in legislature. Low levels of voter awareness: limited civic education, limited access in rural areas to media and information. Low levels of political engagement by women and marginalized groups. Capacities of EMBs require strengthening. Electoral framework originates from one-party era and does not meet international standards in a number of areas. 		
Brief description of project	 Electoral framework originates from one-party era and does not meet international standards in a number of areas. ef description ESP's main goal is to further strengthen national capacities for the 		
Key project successes	• All election-related materials including ballot boxes, seals, indelible ink and ICT equipment necessary for the Union and Zanzibar elections were delivered on time.		
	• Referendum: UNDP provided significant support to ZEC in preparation for		

	the July 31st Referendum in Zanzibar. This included assistance with voter education, procurement materials, provision of results management	
	software and a results centre, poll workers' training, and technical	
	assistance on the legal framework.	
	Results and candidate management software was developed by UNDP	
	and delivered on time fully operational and available for data capturing, data	
	transfer and presentation of results.	
	• Election Results, Media and Observer Support Centres: Two Election	
	Results and Media and Observer Support Centres were established in Dar	
	es Salaam and Zanzibar. Accreditation of 4,600 observers and media was	
	processed at these centres.	
	• Electoral legal framework: Assistance was provided in amending various	
	codes of conduct and guidelines. 350,000 copies of election-related	
	guidelines and regulations were printed and distributed to the relevant	
	 stakeholders including political parties and observers. Training: Large scale country-wide training took place for women 	
	candidates, political party officials, journalists, police officers and members	
	of the Special Forces in Zanzibar, involving more than 10,000 persons.	
	Voter Education materials: 1,200,000 booklets including Citizens	
	Guides, 3 million posters and 15 million leaflets targeting women, youth and	
	persons with disabilities were printed and distributed for both the Union and	
	Zanzibar elections.	
	Voter Education Grant Facility (VEGF): 43 CSOs were conducted	
	outreach activities in different parts of the country, including road shows,	
	sports/music/theatre events, and town hall meetings, amongst others. An	
	estimated 18.7m contacts were made through the VEGF activities.	
	• Women's radio listening groups: UNIFEM trained 220 community radio	
	broadcasters and distributed 3,000 radios to established listening groups in	
	Tanzania. An estimated 60,000 women in rural areas participated in these	
	listening groups.	
	· Local Observation: UNDP funded the Tanzanian Election Monitoring	
	Committee (TEMCO) to facilitate domestic election observation. TEMCO, a	
	network of 152 CSOs, trained and deployed over 7,000 short-term	
	observers and 223 long-term observers to observe political campaigns,	
	polling, counting and results aggregation.	
	· Incident Reporting and Response System (IRRS): UNDP worked with	
	the Tanzanian Police Force (TPF) to develop a nationwide system for	
	reporting and responding to incidents. TPF's radio communications and ICT	
	equipment was significantly upgraded, two control centres were established	
	in Zanzibar and Dar es Salaam, and GIS-based incident tracking software	
	developed.	
	• Assets management system (AMS): 95%+ of assets procured by UNDP	
	were entered into specialized assets tracking software and on the job	
	training was provided to NEC, ZEC and TPF.	
	• Newsletters: The project produced 15 newsletters and a website	
	providing updates on ESP activities and other information useful to election	
	stakeholders.	
Project	Main challenges for the project were:	
shortcomings and	 The late start (caused by delayed signing of the project document, 	
solutions	slow approval of the AWP, and the change in UNDP recruitment	
	processes) compressed the implementation period and affected	
	project impact in key areas such as voter education, and training of	
	journalists and political party officials and candidates.	
	 Procurement: existing regulations and modalities required careful 	
		planning and long lead-in times. Few LTAs were in place for suppliers, and a limited roster of consultants.
-----------------	-------	---
	0	Some national project staff hired was unfamiliar with UNDP regulations and elections work, and only one had experience with ATLAS. This created challenges for finance and procurement-related tasks.
	0	Engagement with EMBs could have been more intensive if project staff was embedded in the EMBs' offices, perhaps with a dedicated liaison role.
	0	Significant time and energy was spent building up the PMU: getting staff in place, setting up the office building and facilities, establishing business processes, resolving problems with internet, electricity, water, etc.
	0	The project design did not foresee dedicated staff to lead Components 3, 4 and 5: media, political parties and observation.
	0	Some misperceptions persisted on the part of election stakeholders about the role and purpose of the project, particularly political parties.
	How t	nese challenges were addressed:
	0	International staff had to put in large amounts of overtime over extended periods. This impacted on morale, but did enable the work plan to be delivered.
	0	The project absorbed much of the administration related to recruitment and procurement, which gave it more control but tied down project management in administrative issues.
	0	Effective and coordinated support was provided to the project by the CO Senior Management Team.
Lessons learned	0	The project team should be in place 18 months prior to E-Day. Having the business processes, equipment, office facilities, ATLAS access, etc. in place at the start of implementation increases the likelihood of delivery. An operations or project management specialist should be in place to support project start up.
	0	Streamlined processes for approval of payments should be in place at the start of the project, as well as additional procurement capacity to complete the major procurements early on.
	0	
	0	Timely availability of funds for the project is important for better planning and cash flow management.
	0	The project developed several communications products which were well received and became an important source of election-related information (e.g. legislation, observer reports, etc.). The project's newsletter proved a valuable channel for disseminating information quickly and cheaply, and this could be replicated elsewhere.
	0	The focus of donor support for the project was on the election event itself rather than the electoral cycle. The provision of structured, longer term support to the EMBs should reduce the need for large scale support around the elections.
	0	ICT-related elections assistance is complex and highly technical. Assessments and planning of support in this area need to take place at an early stage to ensure EMBs and elections staff are fully familiar with new software and hardware, and there is adequate opportunity for adjustments and debugging.

0	Provision of specialized assets management software to the EMBs and the Police can make a major contribution to sustainability of project inputs, particularly if combined with on the job coaching and dedicated assets staff.
0	Regular briefings with election stakeholders (political parties, media, CSOs, etc.) and other UN agencies could provide a forum for better flow of information about the project's mandate and activities, and minimize misperceptions.
0	It was good foresight for the project to have its own Gender Specialist with the same status as the other component leaders.
0	The project maintained a sub-office in Zanzibar which significantly increased the support provided to ZEC. Having staff embedded within the EMBs would probably be even more effective, and this should be given serious consideration in the design of future elections support.
0	The project's Steering Committee and Technical Committee provided effective guidance and their roles were clearly separated. CSO and national participation on the committees was irregular and political parties were not directly represented. Separate Technical Committees for the Union and Zanzibar elections created additional workload but had the benefit of keeping the two elections processes separate.
0	Particularly when there is a need for quick project implementation, project admin/procurement/finance staff should be reassigned from within UNDP, in order to have sufficient familiarity in the project with UNDP regulations and procedures.

Table 3: Lessons Learned

VI. FINANCIAL STATUS AND UTILISATION

(i) Financial Summary

The overall budget approved for the project was USD28,647,110 and total income received by UNDP was USD28,018,323 (97.8% of the budget). Total project expenditure at 13th March 2012 was USD25,644,518, which is 90% of the agreed budget. Although funding agreements were in place at an early stage, not all funds were released quickly. Only 20% of the funds had been disbursed in the first 6 months of the project, and 60% of the funds in the first two quarters of 2010, and 80% approximately 1 month prior to the elections. However, the project was able to manage the cash flow so that implementation was not adversely affected.

The original AWP for the period leading up to the elections was approved on 10th March 2010 by the project's Steering Committee. This AWP was revised twice; once in May 2010 to reallocate funds for support to the July 31st Zanzibar Referendum, and again in October 2010 to accommodate NEC's request for bar code readers to be used at polling stations.

Donor	Committed	Disbursed	Actual income received (USD)
Canada	CDN\$	CDN\$	983,284
	1,000,000	1,000,000	000,201
Denmark	DKK 5,000,000	DKK 5,000,000	995,778
EU	EUR 2,700,000	EUR 2,690,669	3,353,845
Finland	EUR 2,000,000	EUR 2,000,000	2,839,409
Netherlands	USD 1,300,000	USD 1,215,000	1,215,000
Norway	NOK 6,000,000	NOK 6,000,000	1,023,716
Sweden	SEK 43,000,000	SEK 43,000,000	6,151,645
Switzerland	USD 1,000,000	USD 1,000,000	1,000,000
UNDP	USD 1,000,000	USD 1,008,006	1,008,006
United Kingdom/DFID*	GBP 6,700,000	GBP 6,700,000	9,447,640
Total			28,018,323

(ii) Financial Overview

One Fund

* DFID contributions were made through the

 Table 4: Contributions to the Donor Basket

(iii) Financial Utilization

Financial Utilization Report for June 2009 to March 2012 Award No. 57788.

	Project Components	Project no.	Revised Budget 2009-2012	2009	2010	2011	2012	Cumulative Expenditure June 2009 - March 2012	Balance	Delivery Rate (%)
			А	В	с	D	Е	F (B+C+D+E)		(F/A) x 100
1	Component 1 (Assistance to NEC and ZEC)	74434	9,382,000	482,146	5,387,472	2,510,931	51,178	8,531,728	850,272	91%
2	Component 2 (Voter education)	74423	6,025,000	205,561	5,499,051	(572,685)	0	5,131,926	893,074	85%
3	Component 3 (Media)	74430	1,470,000	33,067	848,751	370,737	0	1,252,556	217,444	85%
4	Component 4 (Political parties)	74431	1,920,000	5,435	2,125,669	94,949	0	2,226,053	(306,053)	116%
5	Component 5 (Observation)	74432	2,150,000	0	2,026,791	(11,414)	0	2,015,377	134,623	94%
6	Component 6 (Peaceful environment)	74433	2,770,000	2,223	2,300,789	444,301	0	2,747,313	22,687	99%
7	Operational costs, Monitoring & Evaluation	74071	2,056,000	530,650	1,163,994	543,929	2,153	2,240,727	(184,727)	109%
8	Subtotal 1-7		25,773,000	1,259,083	19,352,516	3,380,749	153,331	24,145,680	1,627,320	94%
	Realized exchange rate loss/gain			2,492	(11,721)	(17,268)	45	(26,451)		
9	Contingency		1,000,000	0	0	0	0	0	1,000,000	0%
10	UNDP General Management Support Costs / GMS (7%)		1,874,110	32,584	1,191,561	301,145	0	1,525,290	348,820	81%
11	Total		28,647,110	1,294,159	20,532,356	3,664,626	153,376	25,644,518	2,976,141	90%

Table 5: Financial Utilization

Notes:

1. This financial report is preliminary and is subject to change until the UNDP Comptroller issues the final Certified Financial Statement.

2. The data source for this report is the Combined Delivery Report (CDR) by Activity with Encumbrance.

3. 'Expenditure' includes encumbrance as per UNSAS.

4. GMS is charged at 7% on expenditure without encumbrance. It is not charged on expenditure of UNDP contributions.

VII. ANNEXES

Annex 1:

• Summarized project results, by Component

Annex 2:

- Project Document
- Project staffing chart

Annex 3 (on disk):

Significant project products and resources:

- Media monitoring programme report (Synovate)
- Voter Education Grant Facility report (Deloitte)
- Manuals for training of elections officials
- Manual for training of police on public order
- Manual, curriculum and handbook for training of political parties
- Manual and handbook for women candidates
- Survey of voting behavior (Synovate)
- Samples of voter education materials
- Comparison of findings of 2005 and 2010 Observer reports
- Observer mission reports
- Results Management System process flowchart
- Report on Study on Women's Political Participation
- Report on Study on Voter Turnout in the 2010 Union Elections
- Report on Study on Voter Registration in the 2010 Zanzibar Elections
- Report on Mapping & Analysis of 2010 election-related incidents of violence
- ESP newsletters

ANNEX 1

Summarized project results by Component

Component 1: Support to EMBs

Intended Results/ Indicators	Targets	Achievements
A. Awareness of legal framework	enhanced	
A.2 Wide distribution and ready availability of the Electoral Act to all electoral staff, stakeholders and actors	A.2. 85,000 copies of Electoral Act printed and distributed to poll workers and stakeholders covering all 55,000 polling stations and all registered political parties; 3,000 copies of the Zanzibar Electoral Act to be printed.	The Electoral Act was printed and distibuted by the Attorney General's office using its own funds. 3,000 copies of the Zanzibar Electoral Act were printed.
B. Support to Capacity for Manag	ement and Planning provided	
B.1 Enhanced quality of NEC/ZEC planning	Logistical/ operational plan (NEC and ZEC) in use by end of June.	UNDP supported NEC and ZEC to develop operational plans for the elections.
B.2 NEC and ZEC sensitized to special needs of vulnerable groups	At least 10 adjustments are made in the guidelines, procedures and voter education materials that improve access for people from disadvantaged groups by end of June.	As a result of meetings between NEC / ZEC and other election stakeholders, the following changes were made: Use of sign interpreters for deaf people on NEC's TV announcements; introduction of VE materials using Braille; preparation of VE materials for target groups e.g. youth, women, PWDs; VE materials for illiterate people in form of picture cards; use of theatre and music; use of tactile ballot papers for visually impaired voters; increased access to stakeholders in election preparation and feedback meetings; introduction of voter interaction system using SMS for voters to verify their polling stations and data in the voter register; additional 4,406 polling stations in the mainland to give easier access to voters; changes to

		the 2010 Election Code of Conduct (inclusion of the Government as party to the Code).
	to interact with the media enhanced	
C.1 A comprehensive media strategy for the NEC and ZEC established to provide appropriate media management and resources for all media	Media strategy in use by end of June.	Media strategy was developed. NEC/ZEC Commissioners received training organised by UNDP on how to announce election results and conduct interviews.
C.2 Establishment of two Media Centres	Two Media Centres established.	Arrangement for establishing the Media Support Centre in Dar es Salaam was made but it was not operationalized. <i>N.B. The Ministry of Information took</i> <i>charge of accreditation of the media for the mainland.</i> The Media Support Centre in Zanzibar became fully operational by 18 September. Accreditation of the 155 media personnel and press conferences took place.
E. Training for Poll Workers provi	ided	
Cascade Training for ZEC conducted	4,500 (50% male/female) trained by end of July for referendum; 4,500 trained (50% male/female) trained by mid-Oct. for general elections; 90% of trained poll workers have knowledge of essential procedures by polling day.	4,500 poll workers were trained for the July referendum. ZEC decided to use its own resources to train poll workers for the general elections.
E.2 Number of training manuals designed and produced for NEC/ZEC	2,000 copies for ZEC; 60,000 copies for NEC	The following training manuals for NEC were printed: 17,500 Manuals for Returning Officers; 80,000 Guidelines for Direction Clerks; 56,000 Guidelines for Political Parties and Candidates; 199,000 Guidelines for Presiding Officers; Total: 352,500.
F. Assistance to voter registration	provided	
F1. Increase in the percentage of women and men registered in the PNVR/PVR	4% increase in total population registered (compared to 2005) – disaggregated by gender and special needs categories.	Approx. 19% increase over 2005. Figure provided by NEC is 19,728,919 for the mainland. As for ZEC, total registered were 407,658 compared to 509,906 in 2005. N.B. Reasons for decrease in Zanzibar will be indicated in the post-election assessment on voter registration.

 F.3 ZEC has capacity to conduct two rounds of voter registration and to display voters' lists. 1.5. Credibility of the permanent voter register (disaggregated NEC/ZEC) 	All parts of Zanzibar covered with two rounds of registration, and opportunity to view the VL by end of June. Consensus from observers was that the PVR is credible.	There were two rounds of VR. Yet results show a 25% drop in no. of registered voters from 2005. The voters' list was displayed on 24 th October, one week before the election which is an improvement compared to 2005. Most of the observer reports referred to some missing names, incorrect polling station, errors and other anomalies on PVR.
G. ICT Developments Availed		
G.1. Effective system for administering the nomination of candidates	At least 95% of nominations are processed on average within 14 days from closing of submissions.	The system was used to process the nominations for about 9,000 candidates. 100% of nominations were processed within 14 days.
G.2. Improved, IT-supported system for preparation of ballots implemented	Automated ICT supported electronic ballot production possible within a period not exceeding 24 hours.	NEC requested UNDP to produce ballot verification report templates instead of ballots. The system has been developed and applied.
G.3 NEC/ZEC has the technical capacity to transparently report disaggregated election results from the polling station to HQ and to display them on the internet	Technical capacity exists for 95% of constituencies to communicate disaggregated polling station results to NEC/ZEC Headquarters. It is technically possible for NEC/ZEC to make this information accessible through internet—with over 95% of results accessible via internet within one week.	Software capable of disaggregating results down to polling stations was developed and provided to NEC and ZEC to be used on E-day. Internet connections were tested and available in 99% of constituencies. Both EMBs have the technical capacity to publish disaggregated data. There were some delays in publishing the results on the websites mainly due to technical reasons and verification of the data. NEC used the software for data capturing of 150 (out of 239) constituencies (63%). <i>N.B. Owing to lack of available time, NEC reduced the training period for ROs on RMS to just 1 day. This is considerably less than the training period recommended by UNDP. As a consequence of this, 89 ROs opted to use a manual system instead. ZEC used software for capturing of 75% of the polling stations.</i>
	President: 95% available within 72 hours	288 laptops were provided to NEC, and internet

G.4. Ability of the EMBs to accelerate the result aggregation	Ward and Parliament results are not announced at EMB head office level; % targets dependent on EMBs' discretion on capture of information using this system.	modems, scanners, fax machines and generators. These were used for recording and sending of election results to NEC and ZEC. NEC: About 85% of presidential results (209 constituencies) were announced within 72 hours. ZEC: All presidential, parliamentary and council results announced within 72 hours.		
G.5. Voter interaction system provides voters with the ability to access their registration and polling place details.	Voter Interaction System established and operational on time but not able to be used.	UNDP provided a gateway for people to access voters information. Software to pull data from NEC database (voters register) and expose it to 3 rd parties was developed. A new server to facilitate VIS was procured. VIS worked from NEC's website but not through SMS. Problem was the issue of NEC negotiations with mobile operators.		
G.6 Assets management system (AMS) which provides assets tracking and movement control	Asset Management System operational: 70% of items of NEC/ZEC with value above US\$ 300 inventoried in an asset management tracking system	Asset management tracking system operational at the Tanzania Police Force, NEC and ZEC. More than 95% of UNDP procured equipment is recorded into the AMS. TPF, NEC and ZEC staff received hands on direct training while inventory procedures were performed.		
G.7 NEC/ZEC have improved capacity to communicate within the secretariat and with Returning Officers	NEC/ZEC secretariat as well as 70% of Returning Officers included in the electronic communication system	Software to facilitate communication system was procured and delivered to NEC and ZEC. However, email accounts are not yet created. <i>N.B. Name list of</i> <i>election staff was not provided by EMBs. Both EMBs</i> <i>were provided with the software and hardware</i> <i>necessary for this activity and the remaining tasks are</i> <i>yet to be taken by EMBs.</i>		
H. Website development and Support				
H.1 The websites of the NEC and ZEC enabled to be used as the major information and interaction portal for all interested in the operations and functions of the NEC and ZEC.	NEC/ZEC websites updated with minimum of 50,000 visits to NEC and 10,000 visits to ZEC website (June to Nov 2010); also increases in the number of pages viewed and time spent per visit.	ZEC website went down after a virus attack. The website was made operational again by UNDP during the referendum but was not further updated by ZEC. UNDP made minor updates to information on the NEC website. No major reworking of the website has been done. <i>N.B. The responsibility and decision making authority of what information can be placed on an</i>		

		EMB's website can only be undertaken by the EMBs.
I. Election Results Management		
I.1 Election Result Centre established for both NEC and ZEC	Two election results centres established and operational.	Results Centre in Zanzibar (at Bwawani Hotel) was operational by 20 th September. In Dar es Salaam installation was finalised on 28 th October (at Paradise City Hotel). The centre was fully operational on E-Day.
J. Procurement for Election Day A	Activities carried out	
J.1 ESP contribution to EMB effectiveness: Essential equipment for E-Day procured in time and in	1.4 100% of ESP procurements above \$100,000 delivered on time; NEC: 45,000 ballot boxes, 1,000,000 seals, 110,000 bottles of indelible ink.	100% of E-Day materials including the ICT equipment for Results Management System (300 laptops and scanners) were delivered in time:
sufficient numbers	ZEC: 24,000 seals, 2,000 bottles of indelible ink and 4,500 voting booths provided for the referendum; 60,000 seals, 9,100 bottles of indelible ink for general elections	ZEC: 2,900 bottles of indelible Ink and 5,800 lanterns were supplied for the referendum and additional 2,800 voting booths were supplied for the general elections.
1.6. Sustainability of the benefits from ESP for election preparation in future years	1.6.a. 80% of all major procurement to be usable in 2015	91% of all major procurement is expected to be usable in 2015. Most suitable usage of the 350 Results System laptops (7%) is being determined.
K. Interaction with Election stake	holders undertaken	
K.1 Improved dialogue among EMBs, civil society and political parties	Meetings lead to improved understanding and reduced complaints	Meetings between EMBs and stakeholders were held. Results of the meetings are the 10 changes listed under Indicator B.2 above. <i>N.B. Additional meetings could not</i> <i>be held because key stakeholders' (NEC and ZEC)</i> <i>calendar would not allow.</i>
L. Election Hotline		
L.1 Enhanced information about the electoral event to the general public on request.	Hotline operational by August 15 th – 300 calls/day	NEC: Hotline services were made available for 19 days. 3,941 calls were received for NEC (207 per day). ZEC: Hotline services were made available for 19 days. 520 calls were made for ZEC (27 per day). There was insufficient time to advertise the service widely before the elections
M. Election Appeals and Complain	nts (A&C)	

M.1 Provide information to the judiciary on the laws on electoral appeals and complaints to obtain consistency in process, procedures and outcomes of appeals.	Decisions accelerated by 50% compared with 2005.	84 judges and 190 magistrates were trained over four workshops, with resources persons from Uganda and Kenya. Unfortunately, the complaints and appeals moved slowly through the courts, probably as a result of lack of funding.
N. Opinion Polling for NEC and ZE	C	
N.1 Before-after change in public perception of NEC, ZEC and their role in the electoral process	Reliable data with which to assess the status of the election and EMBs.	Synovate conducted large scale opinion surveys, comparing pre- and post-election perceptions and levels of understanding. The surveys were conducted on awareness of EMBs, confidence in EMBs, satisfaction with EMBs in 5 different aspects, i.e. gender, setting, literacy, age, PWDs.
1.3 Voters confidence in the EMBs	Improvement by 10% in the confidence rating between pre and post-election poll	The target of improvement by 10% in the confidence between pre and post polls was not reached. General public's confidence in NEC decreased from 74.3% to 70.3% i.e. 4% decrease. Unlike NEC, public's confidence in ZEC increased by 5.5% from 78.7% to 84.2%. [Source: Synovate Election Opinion Polls Survey]
1.1. EMBs plan and manage the electoral process effectively	NEC 2010: Majority of observer organisations assess "managed effectively and transparent" ZEC 2010: Majority of observer organisations assess "manage effectively with some short comings"	Majority of observer organizations assessed NEC and ZEC's management as effective overall while noting some shortcomings such as technical irregularities and delays, some aspects of the electoral law, transparency of the process, and independence of NEC.

Component 2: Support for Voter Education

Intended Results/ Indicators	Targets	Achievements
2.1. Improved understanding of voters on the registration and voting process in particular among project target groups: women, PWD, youth, non-literate, people in remote areas	At least a 30% improvement from pre- opinion polls (with 50% improvement among women (see D.1.b), youth (see D.2.b), people with disabilities (see D.3.b), non- literates (see D.4.b)	WOMEN: Increased knowledge of voting process from 55% pre- election polls to 93% post opinion polls. NON-LITERATES: Knowledge of voting process increased from 35% pre- election polls to 86% post-election. PWDs: Knowledge of voting process increased from 52% pre-election to 82% post-election. YOUTH: Knowledge of voting process increased from 63% pre-election to 94% post-election. PEOPLE IN REMOTE AREAS: While the target of 60% was probably not realistic, knowledge of rural voters increased on nearly all issues. [Source: Synovate Election Opinion Survey]
% of voters who have basic understanding of the institutions of President, Parliament and District Councils	Increase by 50% between pre and post polls (with positive trends among key target groups)	Target of 50% increase in understanding of roles of the institutions was not met but understanding of all key institutions increased for all key target groups. <i>N.B. Target was not realistic; Synovate advised that a target of 20% was more appropriate due to complexity of the subject matter.</i>
2.2. ESP-supported voter education lead to a decrease of spoiled ballots	2.1.b Union Elections: Less than 3 % ³ Zanzibar: Less than 1.3%	Spoiled ballots for Union elections in 2010 stands at 2.6% compared to 4.3% during 2005 elections. As for Zanzibar 2010 elections, spoiled ballots stands at 1.7% compared to 2.1% in 2005. <i>N.B. For Zanzibar, the target was almost met but short by 0.37% possibly due to inadequate distribution of voter education materials.</i>
2.3. Increased voter turnout	2.3. Union elections: 80% ⁴ Zanzibar elections: 90%	Voter turnout for Union elections was 72.4% in Zanzibar and 42.9% for the mainland. Zanzibar elections voter turnout stands at 89.5% in 2010 compared to 90.8% during 2005 elections. <i>N.B. An indepth study on the reasons for low voter turnout in the mainland is under preparation.</i>

³ Target set in NEC Voter Education Strategic Plan (2008-10), p 21.
⁴ Target set in NEC Voter Education Strategic Plan (2008-10), p 21.

A. Voter Education Reference	A. Voter Education Reference Group (VERG)		
Number of VERG general meetings	Two VERGs, one for mainland and one for Zanzibar A minimum of 6 meetings each	16 VERG meetings were held since January. Nine meetings for ZEC Zanzibar and 7 meetings for NEC Tanzania mainland. All VERG reports were documented.	
B. Voter education concernit	ng Voter Registration		
Number of radio spots, newspaper articles aired, posters and leaflets distributed	Minimum of 10 radio stations, 10 newspapers. 1,400 repetitions, 75,000 posters, 500,000 leaflets	NEC and ZEC produced spots and newspapers ads for registration for the Union and Zanzibar elections. 500,000 brochures and 50,000 posters were produced by UNDP for NEC, and 25,000 posters and 100,000 leaflets were produced for ZEC voter registration. 5,000 posters and 25,000 leaflets produced for the Display of Voters lists in Zanzibar. Radio spots were produced and broadcasted by NEC on the window available for constituency/polling stations changes.	
C. Voter education through (Civil Society organizations inst	ituted	
C.1-2.a. Number of CSOs participating in VE C.1-2.b. Variety of modalities used for VE C.1-2.c. Estimated number of voters reached by these activities (disaggregated by gender and special needs groups) C.3.a. number of voters in rural areas reached through VEGF	Minimum of 60 CSOs participating (profile provides urban-rural, coverage all regions, for men, women & people with disabilities, the non-literate and for youth and across at least five VE modalities	43 CSOs were contracted to provide VE. UNDP needed to strike a balance between available funding, geographical distribution, target groups and quality of proposals in the selection process. CSOs distributed VE materials and produced and aired radio and TV spots and discussion programmes, youth-oriented events such as film screenings, concerts and theatre, election related conferences with CSOs, village meetings and open public discussions. An estimated 18,748,250 people were reached, including 3,029,913 women, 3,446,821 people with disabilities and 4,057,291 people in rural areas (women are of course included within the latter two groups).	
D. Voter education for key ta			
Degree of gender sensitivity in VE material on a scale of 1 - 10	80% of materials assessed should have a gender sensitive content of at least 5	100% of VE materials were screened for gender sensitivity.	
D.1.b Number of female radio	1,500 radio listening groups	Women groups were established. Radios were distributed to 1,500 women's groups. Approximately 28,500 women are members of	

	L I	nn	70	nı	~
UND	- 1	a 1	20		а

listening groups established in remote areas D.1.c % of women in the survey who have knowledge of the voting process	established; Increase by at least 50% in the number of women respondents with knowledge of the voting process.	these radio listening groups in rural areas. In addition, 5,000 T- shirts, 5,000 kangas and 5,000 posters with advocacy messages for women were printed and distributed. Synovate's surveys showed increase of more than 50%, but data does not allow us to link this result to the radio listening activity. <i>N.B. The data showing</i> % of women with knowledge of the voting process needs to be clarified by Synovate.
D.2a. Number of voter education materials targeting youthD2.b Increase of percentages of youth who have knowledge of the voting process	1 radio and 1 TV station; Increase of 50% between pre and post polls.	600,000 posters and 240,000 booklets for Youth were produced. 4 TV programs, one spot were produced (39 repeats). 4 radio programmes, and one spot were produced (8 repeats). Youth knowledge of voting process increased from 63% pre-election to 94% post-election.
 D.3.a Number of voter education materials addressing the needs of different groups of people with disabilities D.3.b Increase of percentages of disabled persons who have knowledge of the voting process 	1 radio and 1 TV station; 12 repeats for radio, and for TV; 500,000 leaflets; 200,000 posters; 100,000 booklets; 5 newspaper ads; 1,000 Braille pamphlets; 40 TV programmes with sign language; increase by 50% between pre and post polls	600,000 posters and 230,000 booklets were produced for vulnerable groups. 3 TV programmes were produced (12 repeats - all with sign language interpretation). 3 radio programmes were produced (12 repeats), and 1,000 copies of the Braille pamphlets were distributed.
D.4.a. Number of voter education materials targeting the non-literate D.4.b. Increase of percentages of non-literate who have knowledge of the voting process (segregated by gender) E. Civic and voter education	50 radio and 10 TV station; 64 repeats radio, TV; 500,000 leaflets; 100,000 posters; 5 newspaper ads in 10 papers; 100 sets of picture cards; increase by 50% between pre and post polls	5,000 sets of picture cards and 605,000 posters were produced. 5 newspaper ads were published in 10 papers.

UNDP	Tanzania
------	----------

E.1 Number of TV and Radio sessions produced and aired for 10 to 15 minutes and materials distributed	50 radio and 10 TV stations; 2 repeats each period for both radio and TV; 200,000 booklets; 100 civic education curriculum guides.	200,000 booklets for NEC and 40,000 for ZEC were produced. 600,000 posters were produced. 4 TV programmes and one spot were produced (39 repeats). 4 radio programmes and one spot were produced (8 repeats).
F. Civil Society Capacity Bui	Iding undertaken	
Key election stakeholders have a forum to provide suggestions for further improvement of the electoral framework and processes	8 conferences for VE, 7 zonal meetings for women, 1500 persons/activists	4 conferences were held since January 2010: Youth Conference – NEC (162 participants); Youth Conference ZEC (150 participants); PWDs Conference (150 participants); Human Rights and Election Conference (150 participants). Total participants: 612. <i>N.B. two</i> <i>post-election conferences with CSOs were cancelled as these</i> <i>were not considered priority activities by the EMBs.</i>

Component 3: Support to Media

Intended Results/ Indicators	Targets	Achievements
3.1. Less biased election media coverage	3.1 At least 15% improvement in media providing unbiased information (target may be adjusted to baseline)	Comparison between 2005 and 2010 is yet to be submitted from Synovate. But the general findings for 2010 alone indicate that some media were biased in their coverage of parties: 48% of newspaper coverage was dominated by CCM, 24% for CHADEMA and 14% for CUF. Radio coverage: 50% for CCM, CHADEMA 26%, and CUF 20%; TV coverage was 48% for CCM, CHADEMA 30%, CUF 17%.
		[Source: Synovate Election Opinion Survey]
3.2. Perception of voters that consider media biased / unbiased	3.2 10% improvement of voter perceptions of media handling of the 2010 election	There is an improvement of voter perception of media neutrality from 54% pre-election polls to 62% post election polls. The target was 59.7%, so the results met the target of 10% improvement of voter perception of media handling 2010 election. [Source: Synovate Election Opinion Survey]

3.3 Journalists have a better understanding of unbiased reporting	3.3 80% have good understanding of unbiased reporting	The data indicates that on average, 80.2% of journalist participants have good understanding of unbiased reporting of elections. The breakdown is: 87.8% of the print media journalists; 75% of TV media journalists and 77.7% of radio journalists. [Source: TBC report]	
3.5. Has media monitoring provided the public with accurate information about the level of bias of Tanzanian media during the 2010 elections	3.5. Monitoring reports widely circulated, discussed than was the case in 2005	Media monitoring reports were produced on a weekly and monthly basis and were widely distributed. These reports were also made available on the Synovate's website. This enabled the public to receive accurate information about the conduct of the Tanzania media during the 2010 elections. Media practitioners, political parties, development partners and non-state actors were some of key institutions which received these reports.	
3.6. Level of gender sensitive reporting and degree of sensitivity toward people with special needs	Media provide similar proportional time to female candidates, by media source; improved inclusion of special needs in media reporting over 2005	Synovate's report explains that there was limited media coverage of women candidate's unlike their male counterparts. 9% of coverage was related to marginalized groups' issues. Synovate produced weekly and monthly reports. Website was established and reports were widely distributed to stakeholders. <i>N.B. Data on media coverage of the people with special needs in 2005 needs to be provided by Synovate so that the comparison can be made.</i>	
A. Media Codes of Conduct	for Election Coverage Amended		
Increased adoption of the Media Codes of Conduct among media houses	70% of media houses make use of the Codes obligatory, by end of September	The Codes of Conduct were reviewed and adopted by the majority (over 70%) of the media houses in both mainland and Zanzibar. Awareness workshops on the Code were conducted across the country. However, the Codes lacked a viable enforcement mechanism and there were many infringements.	
B. Training and Awareness F	B. Training and Awareness Raising		
B.1.a. Number of training events conducted and number of participants disaggregated by genderB.1.b. Improved ability to	Minimum 15 w/shops for radio journalists, 10 workshops for print journalists, 2 workshops for TV journalists conducted – at least 900 women and men trained/coached – note	Numbers of workshops conducted were: 6 for TV journalists; 7 for radio journalists; 11 for newspaper journalists (i.e. print media). In total, 718 journalists were trained including 316 radio journalists and 18 trainers; 155 TV journalists; 229 newspaper journalists. In each of the workshops, about one third of participants were women. 80% showed increased knowledge, 70% were positive	

provide free, fair, balanced,	disaggregate data by gender.	about the relevance of the training. [Source: MCT]
accurate and gender balanced	80% show desired competencies	
media election coverage	at close of training – disaggregate	
	data by gender.	
C. Wider supply of Media Ele		
C.1.a Number of daily news summaries prepared and distributed	At least 30 local broadcasters identified. Daily summaries distributed over	A journalist was recruited and prepared daily summaries in the form of a newsletter, from early October 2010 up to the end of May 2011. The summaries were disseminated and widely used by 60 local radio and TV stations across the country. Feedback from
C.1.b Proportion of targeted local broadcasters that are	70 days between August 1 st and November 15 th .	the journalists was very positive and there were many requests for the service to be continued.
using the summaries	At least 20 local broadcasters make use of these summaries.	
D. Monitoring of Media's Elec	tion Coverage	
D.1.a. Number of media outlets monitored	80 media outlets monitored between June 1 st and Nov 15 th .	40 newspapers (2 from Zanzibar), 31 radio stations (4 from Zanzibar) and 14 TV stations (1 from Zanzibar) were monitored during the duration of the project. 29 weekly and 5 monthly reports
D.1.b. Number of monitoring reports published on website	At least 10 reports are produced.	were published in websites (<u>www.empt.co.tz</u>) and the ESP website.
E. Journalism Election Cove	rage Awards formulated	
E.1.a Number of awards issued, a) in total, b)	At least 100 contributions submitted.	A consultant from MISA-TAN was contracted to develop the concept for the Awards. However, this activity was dropped from 2011 work plan since it was not considered as a priority activity.
recognizing achievement related to gender sensitivity, c) recognizing achievement related to inclusion of special needs aspects	At least 10 awards issued, including at least 2 with a focus on women and on special needs groups as voters or candidates.	
E.1.b number of journalists who participate by submitting media production to the contest		

Component 4: Support to Political Parties

Intended Results/ Indicators	Targets	Achievements
A. Increased Political Party Capa	acity	
4.1.Improved knowledge of political party functionaries of the electoral framework	At least 80% of training participants have increased knowledge 4 rating in a scale of 1-10 3,000 party functionaries trained (gender disaggregated) 80% with increased knowledge	Overall, 5,419 party and other representatives were trained. Among these, 1,627 political parties' representatives were trained on the legal framework in all regions of Tanzania mainland and Zanzibar. 401 female participants and 1,226 male. The data on 80% with increased knowledge is not available from ERIS. <i>N.B. Some regional workshops were combined with other regions due to time constraints.</i>
4.2 Party functionaries of all parties able to train and deploy party agents for E-Day	4.2.At least 80% of training participants have good knowledge; training at national and regional/constituency level; 80% with increased knowledge	3,686 party agents were trained, women 26% and men 74%. The target of having 80% with increased knowledge is not available. <i>N.B. The data on 80% with increased knowledge cannot be provided by ERIS.</i>
4.2b Number of polling stations where there is more than one party agent present on E-Day	In a minimum of 80% of polling stations more than one party agent is present.	The data is not available as the exact figures were not recorded by EMBs. However, observers noted that in most polling stations observed, there was more than one party agent.
4.3. Political party activists have an increased knowledge of effective election conflict resolution mechanisms and strategies to promote female candidates	4.3 At least 80% of training participants have good knowledge of conflict resolution and promotion of women	The exact data not provided by ERIS. However, there was a 'Capacity building training for transformation of election related conflicts' in Zanzibar where the political party officials participated.

4.4. More women a) nominated by political parties, and b) directly elected	4.4 An increase in the number of female candidates by 10%	21 women MPs elected in the mainland compared to 17 during 2005 elections, (+ 24%). Elected women Councillors in the mainland are 172 compared to 126 in 2005 elections.	
		In Zanzibar, 3 women MPs elected compared to 1 in 2005 elections (+ 200%). As for Zanzibar Councillors, number of elected women Councillors increased from 11 to 15 (+ 36%).	
C. Support to women, youth a	nd marginalized groups in political part	ties	
C.1.a. Number of trained female politicians	1600 women activists and candidates trained.	Training for women candidates was finalised. 798 women candidates were trained. The target of 1,600 women could not be met as fewer women candidates	
C.1.b. Number of female candidates competing (special seats not counted)	An increase of 10% in the number of women competing.	were available at the time training was offered. See above figures for numbers of women elected. No. of competing female candidates (excluding special seats): House of Representative: 18, Councillorship: 62	
C.2.b Number of participants (disaggregated by gender and political party) with good knowledge on elections needs of marginalized groups, youth and first time voters	240 political party functionaries trained (gender and political party disaggregated).80% with increased knowledge.	67 people from political parties and marginalized groups were trained. Numbers of female and male participants trained were 25 and 42 respectively. A one-hour TV session covering the conference broadcast was also organized through TBC. The data on 80% with increased knowledge is currently not available.	
D. Political parties and media have an increased ability to interact with media			
D.1 % of Political party participants of training are able to draft media strategy and press releases	80% with increased knowledge	Training took place in August 2010. 27 political party functionaries were trained on media, 12 women and 15 men. Post- training evaluation for this training showed 96% of participants with increased knowledge.	

Component 5: Support for Election Observation

Intended Results/ Indicators	Targets	Achievements
5.1. Improved capacity of EMBs to administer observer missions	5.1.a At least 60% satisfied with the administrative service provided to observer missions	The target seems to be met as both EMBs received positive feedback from observer missions with the rates ranging from 'very good' to 'excellent'.
A. Information Resource Cer	ntre for national and international o	
Observer centres established	2 observer centres operational with all observers using the facility by October 15 th	NEC Observer Centre became fully operational on 27 th September 2010. ZEC Observer Centre became fully operational on 18 th September 2010.
B. National election observa	tion supported	
5.2. Effective domestic election observation	52 long term and 6,000 short term observer women and men; one election observation mission report for Union election, one election mission report for Zanzibar published	TEMCO, funded by UNDP and USAID, deployed 223 long- term observers and 7,350 short-term observers throughout the country for the General Elections in the mainland and Zanzibar. TEMCO will submitted two final reports covering Union Elections and Zanzibar in 2011.
C. International election observation supported		
C.1.a Number of observer kits produced by ESP and distributed in a timely fashion to observer centres	A rating of at least 6 on gender sensitivity on all briefs; sufficient number of kits to be ready by Sept 1 st 2010	For the Union Elections, UNDP provided 500 bags, 11,400 copies of legal documents mainly for international observers. For the Zanzibar Elections, UNDP provided 2,700 folders and printed 20,600 copies of legal and background booklets for local and international observers.
C.1.b Degree of gender sensitivity in political observer training material on scale of 1- 10		UNDP also provided assistance to NEC and ZEC in amending the Guidelines for Local and International Observers.
D. NEC and ZEC supported to facilitate election observation		
D.1 Number of international observers accredited through the observer centres	All observers accredited via NEC/ZEC observer centres.	NEC: 2,700 domestic observers based in Dar Es Salaam and 454 international observers were accredited. <i>N.B. The rest of the domestic observers were accredited by the Returning Officers in their respective districts.</i> ZEC: 138 international

observers and provid	
-------------------------	--

Component 6: Support for a Peaceful Elections Environment

Intended Results/ Indicators	Targets	Achievements
A. Risk assessment		
A.1 Number of risk spots identified and mapped	Comprehensive participatory risk assessment for Mainland and Zanzibar established which identifies high risk areas.	Risk assessment and conflict mapping studies were finalised and used to identify priority areas for the Incident Reporting & Response System. Inputs from the study reports were also used to guide election conferences and dialogue meetings.
B. Dialogue promoted for ma	intenance of a peaceful environm	nent
 B.1.a. Number of conferences, dialogue meetings conducted B.1.b Level of knowledge among political parties concerning police rules of engagement 	Minimum of 50 community dialogue meetings held in identified high risk areas with participation of relevant local leaders. All political parties in Zanzibar have a good knowledge of police rules of engagement.	Three Conferences for Peaceful Elections were held in Zanzibar and Dar Es Salaam. The Mufti's Office organized 62 dialogue meetings with communities. One workshop with 140 participants held for marginalized and vulnerable youth (alcoholic, drug users, and unemployed) was held two days before elections. Dialogue meetings and conferences held led to clear understanding of the rules engagement by all political parties. An MOU was signed between political parties and TPF.
C. Incident reporting and res	sponse system (IRRS)	
6.5. Improved capacity of EMBs and TPF to communicate effectively in relation to election-related incidents	Set up Incident Reporting & Response System (IRRS): Receive delivery of all equipment and components; setup TPF facility for fabrication, programming, AMS and deployment; install IRRS communication components country wide; complete	IRRS (Phase I) was set up: UNDP facilitated installation of 12 of 136 sites and established Joint Command Control Centres (JCCC) in both Tanzania Police Force (TPF) HQ in Dar Es Salaam and Zanzibar. 72 TPF staff were trained on IRRS installation, while 10 from the Radio Department were trained on asset management. Phase II deployment of the remaining 124 sites was completed over February to October 2011. Data from 10 regions shows a 27% increase in reported incidents since deployment of the system, and a dramatic increase in HF

UNDP	Tanza	nia
------	-------	-----

	configuration of Ushahidi platform; complete installation of JCCC in DSM and Zanzibar.	and VHF radio coverage for Regional and District Police.	
D. Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs) trained			
	At least 1,000 POs trained, 80% have increased their level of understanding on the pre-post test.	30 Human Rights TOTs from TPF received an HR refresher course. They later trained 4,451 Police Officers on Human Rights. 794 (18%) of these were women. [source: CHRAGG monitoring report]	
D.1b Number of Police Officers trained as mediators	60 PO trained as TOT mediators	30 TPF Officers were trained on a special Mediator Course. These were from TPF and Zanzibar's special forces. In addition, 64 TPF Officers were trained on Public Order in the mainland (30) and Zanzibar (34) respectively. 33 TPF Officers were trained on Public Order Tactical course. <i>N.B. Instead of training a further 30</i> <i>TPF officers as mediators, UNDP agreed with TPF to engage the</i> <i>UK Police to train 94 officers in Public Order techniques. This was</i> <i>done to increase TPF's capacities in a variety of approaches,</i> <i>instead of just mediation.</i>	

ANNEX 2

Project Document



UNDP Tanzania

